

Unit 16

India

Contents

- 16.1 Introduction
- 16.2 The Path of Development
- 16.3 Stagnation of Indian Economy
- 16.4 Post-Independence Phase of Development
- 16.5 The Present Scenario: Liberalisation, Privatisation and Globalisation
- 16.6 ICT Revolution in India
- 16.7 Poverty Estimates and Poverty Eradication Measures During the Reform Period
- 16.8 Development and Social Sectors
- 16.9 Conclusion
- 16.10 Further Reading

Learning Objectives

The central objective of this unit is to explain:

- development approaches of pre and post independence India;
- aims and objectives of India's Five-Year Plans;
- Indias' development policies since 1990s; and
- Impact of ICTs development and the policies of liberalisation and privatisation in the social sector.

16.1 Introduction

Through the four Blocks of the Book I of this course on Sociology of Development we have familiarised the concept and growth and modernisation perspectives of development as well as the alternative approaches to the mainstream development perspectives. We saw how social and human factors became incorporated in the development discourse in the past few decades. The previous Blocks especially Blocks III and IV discussed the alternative development approaches that concentrate more on social and human aspects of development. As a continuation to this, Block V discusses the development experiences of some of the countries across the world. We begin with a discussion on the development experiences of India.

There is a tendency to look at countries as economies, and very often we view them as "developed", "developing" or "underdeveloped". The process of "economic development" refers to per capita income achieved in a particular year. But if we take into account the meaning of the word "development" as a whole, then it becomes evident that the over all development of all sections of population of the society are not less important than the economic growth. In other words, "development" should occur at both levels - economic and social. For instance, if we find that the per capita income has doubled in a particular country but the basic problems like poverty, unemployment or inequality remain more or less the same, then naturally the word "development" loses its real meaning. Therefore, economic development should be related to human development. When we talk of 'development' in relation to the social

sector, we are, in fact, discussing development keeping in view the aspects of human development of all sections of the population.

The present unit analyses the state of development retrospectively. It looks into the colonial, post colonial and current development policies of India. During the colonial period India witnessed a retarded or stagnated state of economic development. Things started to changing with the attainment of independence when India opted for a planned development. With the accelerated pace of globalisation and larger role of international organisations such as World Bank and IMF in the national polity, there had a major shift in policies towards liberalisation and privatisation of economy, which in turn left its implications in other avenues of society. All these aspects are dealt in detail in this unit.

16.2 The Path of Development

The path to be followed for the development of any society cannot be easily determined and it requires a great deal of planning before deciding on that. In independent India, planning derives its objectives from the Directive Principles of State Policy as outlined in the Indian Constitution. It says, "The State shall strive to promote the welfare of the people by securing and protecting, as effectively as it may, a social order in which justice – social, economic and political – shall inform all the institutions of national life".

As is evident from the above, a lot of planning is required to accompany any kind of development. In fact, planning itself means, "securing a particular objective or a set of objectives". In the context of development, the sphere of planning is economic as well as social. Though the Planning Commission was set up in 1950 to prepare the blueprint of development, India had started making preparations for it even before Independence when the governments were formed in various provinces in 1937 under Government of India Act, 1935.

Formation of the Planning Commission

During the freedom struggle a National Planning Committee was constituted by the Congress with Jawaharlal Nehru as Chairman, with 29 sub-committees to work on different areas. The Committee recommended to the State to play a vital role in the development of infrastructure and in the setting up of basic industries under its aegis, to promote the growth of cottage and village industries under protection, and to abolish all intermediary interests in land with a view to unleashing the forces of growth. It hoped to raise national income by two to three times in a span of 10 years with a view to providing a balanced diet having calorific value of 2400-2800 units to an adult worker, 30 yards of cloth per person and housing with at least 100 square feet per capita. Industrialisation with emphasis on promotion of heavy engineering and machine-making industries, electric power and scientific research institutes, accommodation of cottage and small-scale industries, the dominant role of the state and of public sector in industrial development, and national self-sufficiency to the extent possible were held out as the major planks of the policy.

In order to achieve these objectives, three plans were submitted in 1944 – the Bombay Plan, the People's Plan and the Gandhian plan (See box 16.1). At the same time, a number of sectoral plans and plans for education and health were also prepared. In 1946, when the Interim Government was formed with Jawaharlal Nehru as its executive head, an Advisory Planning Board was constituted which recommended the formation of a National Planning Commission.

Box 16.1 : Bombay Plan, People's Plan and Gandhian Plan

In the year 1938, National Planning Committee of the Indian National Congress, Jawarharlal Nehru as Chairman, had completed its work on a plan for the development of post independence India. Businessmen published their own plan, the so-called "Bombay Plan," in 1944. The signatories include G.D. Birla, with wide interests in the textiles, jute and insurance; J.R.D. Tata, with interests in iron and steel and internal air lines; and Kasthuribai Lalbai, with interests in textiles and shipping. It provided the vision that guided Nehru in formulating the industrial and agrarian policy of India after independence. It carried a vision to develop India industrially and militarily to become a big power. It affirmed that practically every aspect of economic life would have to be rigorously controlled by the Government.

The Indian Federation of Labour under the leadership of M. N. Roy also put out its own plan, the "People's Plan", also in 1944. In which primacy was given to employment generation through improvement in agriculture and developments of small-scale industry. Mahatma Gandhi and his disciples had their own "Gandhian Plan." All had eradication of poverty as their overarching objective. The Gandhian approach to development focused on the village level economy. Such an approach wanted agriculture to be the mainstay of the Indian economy and envisaged the creation of self-sufficient village units. Except the Gandhians, the others viewed state-promoted industrialization as the means for achieving the objective and central planning as essential for this purpose.

The Planning Commission was constituted on 15 March 1950 by a resolution of the Union Cabinet. The Commission was asked to prepare a blueprint of the First Five-Year Plan as a model of development. Since then, a number of Five-Year Plans have been launched, while keeping in mind the needs and resources of the country. Before highlighting the various strategies of the Five-Year Plans of development, let us analyse the situation at the time of independence.

Reflection and Action 16.1

"Development can be explained only in terms of per capita income". Do you agree with this statement? If not, give reasons.

16.3 Stagnation of Indian Economy

At the time of independence, the Indian economy was in a very bad shape. It was going through a period of stagnation, characterised not only by poverty but also by one of the lowest level of per capita income growth, which was approximately 0.5 percent per annum, due to the long spell of colonialism.

The same feelings were echoed in the First Five-Year Plan document. This was primarily because the basic conditions under which an economy can continuously expand were lacking. The impact of modern industrialism in the latter half of the 19th century was felt in this country initially through imports of machine-made goods from abroad, which reacted adversely on the traditional pattern of economic life, this also did not create the impulse for development along new lines. The transition that followed was characterised not by expansion of industry and a diversification of the economic structure but by a decay of India's traditional arts, crafts and industries and by an increasing pressure of population on land. This retrogression led to a decline in productivity per person engaged in agriculture. The result was a continuous increase in unemployment and under-employment and the growth of an attitude of "pathetic contentment" on the part of the people.

In such an environment there could be little economic or social progress. Whatever surpluses might have been available in the colonial era were directed to the purchase of imports, partly of better-finished products from abroad and partly of equipment for the new transportation system designed primarily in the interests of foreign commerce. The responsibility for promoting modern commerce and industry came to be concentrated in the hands of certain classes in the urban areas, and up to the end of the nineteenth century the only major large-scale industries which had taken root in the country were textiles. Little attention was paid to improvement of agriculture or to the needs of the rural areas (Kapila 2001: 25-26).

Reflection and Action 16.2

The Indian economy was going through a period of stagnation at the time of Independence. What were the conditions responsible for the poor performance of Indian economy?

16.4 Post-Independence Phase of Development

With the attainment of independence, India chose to follow the path of planning social and economic development, for which the Planning Commission was set up on 15 March 1950 under the chairmanship of Pundit Jawaharlal Nehru, the first Prime Minister of India. Since then, Prime Minister of India has been the *ex-officio* Chairman of the Planning Commission. Having gone through the background of the Indian economy, we can now analyse the main aims and objectives of the various Five-Year Plans of development.

a) First Plan (1951-56)

The First Five-Year Plan, in fact, paved the way for the planned economic development of the country. It had two main objectives. First, to bring the Indian economy out of the state of stagnation caused by the Second World War and partition of the country. Secondly to initiate the process of all-round balanced development of Indian economy, so as to ensure a steady improvement in the living standards of the people over a period of time.

The First Plan accorded the highest priority to agriculture, with special emphasis on rural reconstruction programmes and land reforms, including initiation of various irrigation and power projects. About 44.6 percent of the total outlay of Rs. 2,069/- crore was allotted for its development. The Plan projected, rather optimistically, that savings and investment as a proportion of national income would rise from an estimated 5 to 6 percent in the early 1950s to 20 percent by 1968-69 and stabilise at that level thereafter. Aggregate income was expected to double in approximately twenty years and per capita income in twenty-seven years (Ibid: 34).

b) Second Plan (1956-61)

In 1954, Parliament declared that the economic policy should have to achieve a socialistic pattern of society with greater equality in income and wealth in sight. The main aim of the Second Plan was, therefore, to promote a pattern of development, which could lead to the establishment of a socialistic pattern of society in India.

The Second Plan was aimed at:

- an increase of 25 percent in the national income;
- rapid industrialisation with particular emphasis on the development of basic and heavy industries;
- large expansion of employment opportunities; and
- reduction of inequalities in income and wealth and a more even distribution of economic power.

In the Second Plan, there was a special emphasis on industrialisation and it also aimed at increasing the national income by 11 percent per annum by 1960-61.

The development strategy of economic growth through modern industrialisation was continued into the Third Plan.

c) Third Plan (1961-66)

The immediate objectives of the Third Plan, which was aimed at self-sufficiency, were:

- to secure an increase in the national income of over five percent per annum and at the same time ensure a pattern of investment which could sustain this rate of growth during subsequent plan periods;
- to achieve self-sufficiency in food grains and increase agricultural production to meet the requirements of industry and exports;
- to expand basic industries like steel, chemicals, fuel and power and to establish machine-building capacity, so that the requirements of further industrialisation could be met within a period of ten years or so mainly from the country's own resources;
- to utilise fully the manpower resources of the country and ensure a substantial expansion in employment opportunities; and
- to establish progressively greater equality of opportunity and bring about reduction in disparities of income and wealth and a more even distribution of economic power (India 1989: 331).

Therefore, in this strategy of development, the public sector was expected to promote the growth of infrastructural facilities like basic and heavy industries and on the other hand, to reduce the concentration of economic power through the expansion of public ownership of means of production.

The first phase of development over the first three Five-Year Plan periods was characterised by fairly sustained growth in per capita income, with an 8 to 10 percent compound growth rate of industrial output, 3 to 3.5 percent compound growth rate in food-grains output and around 1.75 percent growth rate in per capita income (Kapila 2001: 35); thus indicating a steady improvement compared to the pre-independence past.

d) Annual Plans (1966-69)

During the fifties and sixties, there was a stable government, thus paving the right way of planning and development. However, the Indo-Pakistan conflict of 1965, two successive years of severe drought, devaluation of the currency, general rise in prices and erosion of resources available for Plan purposes delayed finalisation of the Fourth Plan. Therefore, instead of the Fourth Plan, three Annual Plans were formulated between 1966 and 1969.

e) Fourth Plan (1969-74)

The Fourth Plan emphasised on improving the condition of the less privileged and weaker sections of society through the provision of employment and education. It aimed at raising the standard of living of the people through various programmes to promote equality and social justice.

f) Fifth Plan (1974-79)

During this period, the economy was facing severe inflationary pressures. Though the major objectives of the plan were to achieve self-reliance and to adopt measures for raising the consumption standards of the people living below the poverty line, emphasis was also put on bringing inflation under control and to achieve stability in the economic situation.

Reflection and Action 16.3

Having gone through various Five Year Plans, can you pinpoint some of the main objectives as well as achievements and shortcomings of these Plans?

g) Sixth Plan (1980-85)

The Sixth Five-Year Plan was formulated after taking into account the achievements and shortcomings of the past three decades of planning. The main objective of the Plan was removal of poverty. Therefore, the strategy was adopted to strengthen the infrastructure for both agriculture and industry. There was also an emphasis on increasing opportunities for employment especially in the rural areas.

h) Seventh Plan (1985-90)

The main objective of the Seventh Plan was to provide employment opportunities and to raise productivity as well as the growth in foodgrains production, with an emphasis on reducing poverty and improving the quality of life in the poor villages and towns.

i) Eighth (1992-97) and Ninth Plan (1997-2002)

Though the Seventh Five-Year Plan went uninterrupted, there were unstable political developments such as assassination of former Prime Minister Shri. Rajiv Gandhi, etc. resulting in short-life governments, and economic crisis due to shortage of foreign exchange. The Eighth Five-Year Plan (1992-97) was, therefore, launched after return of normalcy in 1992, with its emphasis on generation of adequate employment to near full employment by the turn of the century and to achieve self-sufficiency.

The Eighth Plan was initiated against the backdrop of introduction of economic liberalisation, and structural adjustment programmes (to be discussed in the next section). This plan proved to be a turning point when the role of planning in development was questioned and analysed from various viewpoints. Therefore, the Ninth Plan was formulated viewing the role of the state and the private sector as complementary and both were considered essential. The Plan had accorded priority to agriculture and rural development with a view to accelerate the growth rate of the economy.

j) Tenth Plan (2002-2007)

Presently, the Tenth Five-Year Plan is in operation, with its emphasis on expansion of social and economic opportunities for all individuals and groups with reduction in disparities and an indicative target growth rate of 8.0 per annum.

As mentioned earlier, many changes in policies and programmes were introduced keeping in mind the needs and demands of the situation. These reforms, to be precise, can be summed up by the notions of "liberalisation, privatisation and globalisation".

16.5 The Present Scenario: Liberalisation, Privatisation and Globalisation

India opened its economy in early 1990s by adopting "New Economic Policy" (NEP) and structural Adjustment Programme. Although there had been attempts for liberalising Indian economy in 1980s, it was only from 1991-1992 that the government of India had been implementing in earnest a fairly comprehensive economic reforms programme under compulsion due to the balance of payment crisis (the details will be discussed in subsequent units as well), which forced the country to seek financial

assistance from International Monetary Fund (IMF). The then prevailing perception among the international financial bodies with regard to the payment crisis among nations was that it was due to the faulty macroeconomic policies that the country had been pursuing. They placed the growing inefficiency and non-competitiveness of the country's products was due to the subversion of the market forces, which resulted from excess of government controls and quantitative restrictions and the pre-dominant position assumed by the public sector in the economy. India too was following similar economic policies. The problems faced by the country were sought to be solved by macro economic and efficiency promoting policies. Towards this direction, in the year 1991, India adopted New Economic Policy, which promoted opening up of Indian economy through the process of liberalisation and privatisation (Bhalla, S. 2000). This in turn accelerated the process of globalisation of the country and led to a closer integration of Indian economy to the global market.

The New Economic Policy of 1991 included standard structural adjustment measures (you will learn more about this in unit 21) including the devaluation of the rupee, increase in interest rates, reduction in public investment and expenditure, privatisation along with priority accorded to profitability in running public enterprises reduction in public sector food and fertilizer subsidies, increase in imports and foreign investment in capital-intensive and high-tech activities, and abolition of the cash compensatory support for exports, a fairly rapid transition to a more or less market driven exchange rate system, encouragement of the inflow of foreign capital through opening up avenues for foreign institutional investment (FII) and considerable relaxation of controls on foreign direct investment (FDI), significant scaling down of net central bank credit to the government to meet its financing requirement and the large measure of autonomy granted to the RBI for maintaining the country's internal and external balance. There was also abandonment of import substitution policy and phased liberalisation of trade, the effects of which primarily was on the composition of domestic production and absorption. A more market friendly system was put in place after the initiation of reforms in 1991. Except for a few strategic industries the government license system for establishment and capacity expansion (license permitry) was abolished. International trade was liberalised to promote competition and efficiency by removing almost all the import quota, except on consumer goods, and reducing tariff rates to moderate levels. Foreign investment was promoted to modernise technology and take advantage of global division of labour (Parikh 1999).

Globalisation of Indian Economy:

The term "globalisation" in the context of the economy refers to:

- a) reduction of trade barriers with a view to allowing freer flow of goods to (and from) the country;
- b) free flow of foreign capital for investment;
- c) free flow of foreign capital technology; and
- d) free movement of labour and manpower.

Globalisation of the Indian economy refers to the integration of the Indian economy with the world economy by way of liberalisation and opening it up for private investment. These reforms have been introduced to improve and meet the challenges of the Indian economy.

Reflection and Action 16.4

Discuss the changes accorded with the adoption of New Economic policy to the Indian economic policy pursued since Independence.

Liberalisation and Privatisation of Trade, Industry, Finance and Infrastructure

Over the years starting from 1991 there has been a steady liberalisation of Indian economy. International trade has been liberalised and more and more sectors opened up for foreign direct investments and portfolio investments facilitating entry of foreign investors in telecom, roads, sea and airports, insurance and other major sectors.

In 1991, government of India introduced several liberalisation measures relating to trade in various stages. These include automatic approval of up to 51% of equity in high priority industries and trading companies engaged in exporting, 100% equity in export-oriented units subject to some conditions; and NRIs and overseas corporate bodies (OCBs) were allowed to invest up to 100% equity in high priority industries, etc.

In 1996-1997 there was further liberalisation by including 13 more sectors under the 51% equity automatic approval route, extending up to 50% equity participation in three new areas relating to mining, and enhancing the equity limit to 75% for automatic approval in nine priority areas and reconstitution of the Foreign Investment Promotion Board (FPIB) were announced.

In the next year, FDI in financial services was allowed through the FPIB route and fifteen non-banking financial services for FDI were identified. The automatic route for FDI approval in certain infrastructural activities was simplified.

Further liberalisation of FDI was announced in each subsequent year, including permitting up to 26% foreign equity participation in domestic insurance companies in 1999, and in 2000, placing of investment in all sectors except a small negative list under automatic route for FDI approvals.

Foreign portfolio investment was liberalised in 1995-96, permitting NRIs, OCBs and Foreign Institutional Investors (FIIs) to invest up to 24% equity in Indian companies. This limit was raised to 30% in 1998-99. FIIs were permitted to invest in the India Government's dated securities from March 1997 and in Treasury Bills from April 1998. A number of steps liberalising the access to Indian companies of foreign capital through Global Depository Receipts and American Depository Receipts were announced every year since 1995. External Commercial Borrowing rules and procedures were liberalised as well since 1995. Despite these liberalisation measures India could attract much less FDIs compared to China and other Southeast Asian economies such as Indonesia, Malaysia, and Thailand. India's limited success in long-term capital inflows, particularly FDI might be attributed to three factors. First, heavy regulations have not completely gone after liberalisation. Second, there is resistance to FDI by domestic industry in competing areas. Third, inadequacies in physical and legal infrastructure limit India's absorptive capacity, and hence its attractiveness to private foreign investors (Srinivasan 2003).

As a part of the liberalisation of industrial sector Industrial licensing, irrespective of the level of investment, was abolished in July 1991 for all except 18 industries. In 1998-99, 12 of these have been removed from licensing requirements. The number of industries reserved for development exclusively by the public sector has been reduced from 17 in 1991-92 to 3 by 2000-01. These two are two major reforms. The Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Practices (MRTP) Act of 1969 was amended in 1991-92, removing the threshold limits of assets in respect of application of MRTP and of dominant undertakings. The Competition Bill incorporating a modern competitive law was introduced in Parliament in 2001. On the abolition of reservation of products for production by small-scale industries (SSI), from 1997 until 2003, in all 163 products have been de-reserved (ibid).

The main thrust of reforms in the financial sector was on the creation of efficient and stable financial institutions and markets. Reforms in respect of the banking as well as non-banking financial institutions focused on creating a deregulated environment and enabling free play of market forces while at the same time strengthening the prudential norms and the supervisory system. In the banking sector, the particular focus was on imparting operational flexibility and functional autonomy with a view to enhancing efficiency, productivity and profitability, imparting strength to the system and ensuring financial soundness. Reforms in financial markets focused on removal of structural bottlenecks, introduction of new players/instruments, free pricing of financial assets, relaxation of quantitative restrictions, improvement in trading, clearing and settlement practices, more transparency, etc.

Reflection and Action 16.5

What were the steps taken by the Indian government to liberalise Indian industry and financial sector. Examine the social implications of that.

As a part of privatisation of Public Sector Units (PSUs) disinvestment of equity was started in December 1991 and a Disinvestment Commission was set up during 1991-92 for identifying PSUs for equity disinvestment and for suggesting modalities of disinvestment. The pace of disinvestment was not so satisfying during the first decade of reforms with realised revenues from sale of public equity being modest (roughly 35% of the target of Rs. 78,300 crores were realised in the period 1991-92 to 2002-03 (India 2003). The successful privatisation of Bharat Aluminium Company Limited (BALCO), particularly its affirmation by the Supreme Court after it was challenged, changed the climate for privatisation for the better. Although a good number of PSUs had been disinvested either by the sale of equity or through strategic sale, the political disagreements in disinvesting high profile PSUs such as Indian Airlines, Air India etc suggest that the political economy considerations are still unfavourable to large scale disinvestment in our country.

Privatisation in infrastructure sector began with the amendment of relevant legislation to permit private enterprises to enter power generation in October 1991. But not much headway was created in this sector even after a decade and a half. Where as reforms have been much successful in telecommunications sector. Value added services were opened to private sector in 1992, followed by the enunciation of the National Telecom Policy in 1994-95 which opened up basic telecom services to competition. Foreign equity participation up to 49% was permitted in case of a joint venture between an Indian and a foreign firm. The Telecom Regulatory Authority of India (TRAI) was established in 1997. In order to separate the service-providing function of publicly owned telecom enterprises and policy-making function, both of which were initially with the Department of Telecommunications, a separate Department of Telecom Services was set up in 1999-2000. The two public sector service providers were corporatised in 2000-01. International long-distance business, which was a public sector monopoly, was opened to unrestricted entry in 2002-03. The Universal Service Support Policy came into effect in April 1, 2002, under which an universal service levy (USL) at 5% of adjusted gross revenue of all telecom carriers (except pure value added service providers) has been fixed. The Universal Service Fund, financed by the levy, will subsidize access to public and community phones in villages as well as individual household phones in net high cost rural/remote areas. The two basic goals of reforms are: delivering low-cost voice telephony to the largest possible number of individuals, and delivering low-cost high-speed computer networking to the largest number of firms (Srinivasan 2003).

Roads sector is another field of infrastructure reforms. A key reform was the creation of a major new source of funding for national, state and rural road

construction, called the Central Road Fund (CRF) under the Central Road Fund Act of 2000. The National Highway Development Project financed by the CRF is one of the largest single highway projects in the world. It includes the nearly 6,000 km of Golden Quadrilateral (GQ) connecting the four metropolitan cities of Chennai, Delhi, Kolkata and Mumbai and 7,300 km of North-South and East-West Corridor. Indian Railways (IR) have undertaken several reforms to improve their functioning. The government has approved restructuring of four metro airports (Chennai, Delhi, Kolkata and Mumbai) to make them world class and approval in principle has been granted for setting up new international airports in Bangalore, Hyderabad and Goa with private sector participation (India 2003).

Reflection and Action 16.6

Have you read in newspapers the political debates related to the disinvestments in telecom sector? In your opinion what are the positive and negative impacts of privatization of telecom sector.

Impact of Reforms in Economic and Social Sectors

It is a decade and a half that India adopted new economic policy and fall into the path of liberalisation of economy. A drastic policy shift from that of mixed economy – the policy followed till 1990, will definitely show its impact both in the economic and social fronts. Let us take a stock of these impacts here. It needs to be stressed here that all these macroeconomic indicators cannot be attributed to reform programmes only.

If we look at the positive impact in the economic front, we can see that after a dip in the GDP growth rate along with a sharp absolute decline in aggregate investment during 1991-92, there was a spurt in GDP growth from 1992-93 onwards. In the first half of the financial year 2005-06 the economy grew by 8.1% compared to 7.1% of the corresponding period in the previous year. Indeed not only were growth rates of GDP, per capita income and capital accumulation higher in 1992-2001 than the corresponding averages in the 70s and the 80s. There was also a considerable fall in the poverty ratio, from 36.0 percent to 26.1 percent, between 1993-94 and 1999-2000 (India 2003).

The performance of economy was quite remarkable in the external sector. There was considerable improvements in balance of payments, increase in the foreign exchange reserves, a sharp decline in the short term debt as percentage of forex reserve etc. the economy also become much more open since economic reforms and there was a rise in the country's share of exports in world trade from below 0.5% to nearly 0.6% in over a period of one decade.

Following are some of the major accomplishments of the financial reforms:

- domestic deregulation of industry, dismantling the system of industrial licensing and production controls, which enhanced the domestic competition
- liberalisation of trade and significant drop in tariff rates
- liberalisation of financial sector

Along with these positive growth tendencies there also had been some negative trends. After managing a rapid recovery, India economy lost its growth momentum within a few years of inception of economic reforms. The average GDP and per capita income growth during 1997-2001 was significantly lower than the in 1992-1997. The second and no less disturbing development during the 1990s was the extremely low growth of overall employment, belying the expectation that the reforms programme, through stimulation of labour intensive activities, would help harnessing in the growth process the country's huge untapped human resources. As the latest Economic Survey reveals, between the periods 1983-94 and 1994-2000 the average annual growth rate of total employment recorded a steep fall from 2.04% to 0.98%.

Financial sector reforms have been much more comprehensive than reforms in other areas. However this sector also has displayed quite a few negative developments. The most important of these are: a) decline in bank credit to the commercial sector and increasing bank holding of SLR securities far in excess of the stipulated minimum; and b) failure of the capital market, especially during 1995-2000, to provide finance for domestic capital formation. Another impact of the opening up of Indian economy was that it was being subjected to external (financial) shocks to a greater extent than in 1980s or before (Rakshit 1998).

In the social sector too globalisation features both negative and positive tendencies. Unemployment due to replacement of the traditional technology by modern technology has made its negative impact, whereas availability of new opportunities in the employment market has made its positive impact. Study by SEWA Academy on *The impact of globalisation on informal sector* (www.sewa.org) shows that globalisation of Indian economy has both positive and negative affects on the sector. For example, introduction of machinery in construction sector has resulted a decrease in labour demand at urban areas whereas increase in rural areas. As rural areas are also going for houses made of cement and bricks rather than mud. On the other hand, increased demand of embroidered work in global market has increased the work in embroidery workers. On the other hand, garment workers have undergone through the positive as well as negative affect of globalisation. Increased in demand of garments has increased the work in garment sector but continuous change in fashion world has demanded a continuous upgrading of work quality, which found to be difficult with workers in informal sector. Even, the small and marginal farmers have gained from the globalisation as they are able to cultivate their land thrice in a year with the advancement of technology but excessive use of fertilizers and pesticides has decreased the overall profit of the farmers.

Reflection and Action 16.7

Examine the liberalisation of trade in the labour standards in India. Take cues from newspaper reports etc.

Due to liberalisation and globalisation advanced technologies, instruments and medicines in the field of medical science are available even in our country. Thus, with the help of telemedicine, today specialised doctors of USA and Germany can assist the ongoing operations in India. Also, India is now producing advanced equipments required for operation; this has effectively reduced the cost price of items needed during operation. After the Government of India lifted price control over drugs, tough competition has been found among the drug manufacturers. As a result, the cost of some drugs has reduced.

Despite these positive aspects, there are some negative aspects of globalisation in the health sector. For example, some essential and life-saving drugs have become expensive due to the removal of price control and also many more irrational drugs are available in the market than before. Other than this, today new high order antibiotics are prescribed for minor conditions, like cold and cough. This has in turn resulted in drug resistance.

16.6 ICT Revolution in India

The new millennium ushered a world of greater interconnectivity with greater flow of data and information and shrinking time and national boundaries. The force behind this rapid transformation is revolutionary changes in Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs).

The digital economy of India at the beginning of 21st century was marked by an explosion in the cellular phone market, a boom in outsourcing, steady Internet growth, media convergence, growth in rural ICT initiatives. In India, ICT

revenues rose from \$150 million in 1990 to \$4 billion in 1999. The global outsourcing market is worth more than \$100 billion, with over 185 Fortune 500 companies outsourcing software requirements to India. India currently has 1,250 companies exporting ICT software (*Human Development Report 2001*).

Government of India is also taking special initiatives to encourage ICT revolution to its land and people. In the ICT industry, the recent cuts in excise duty on computer hardware and cellular phones are expected to drive domestic demand for hardware in 2004 - 2005. A number of high-profile events have focused on the importance of bringing the fruits of the ICT revolution to a wider user base, especially in rural areas, where most of India's population lives.

The IT Ministry of India has started a revolution in ICTs through languages. India is a country of 22 official languages and only 5% of Indian population can read and understand English. Even if India witnesses a considerable telecom penetration, ICTs will be still less useful because of its availability in English. To quickly make available to end-user there shall be software in all official Indian languages. The Hindi software was released in 2005. The government is in an attempt to make available computer software in all other Indian languages.

ICTs can be used effectively for poverty alleviation. It can improve the access of the poor to health, microcredit, government services and to create direct employment opportunities, provide training and education to people, and support the poor in the production, storage and marketing of farm and non-farm products. ICTs can also facilitate the generation and exchange of community-based information and stimulate the establishment of small and medium-sized enterprises. It can break barriers to knowledge by providing demand-driven information and services to the rural poor. There are many pro-poor ICT initiatives in India aimed primarily at improving the availability of market and other information for livelihood improvement. For example Information Village Research Project run by the Centre for Research in Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Development of the M.S. Swaminathan Research Foundation in Chennai, Tamil Nadu (www.msrif.org). It provides through a telecentre the facility for public access to telecommunications and information services like health, education, market data, technology and livelihood to a disadvantaged community. The Foundation's telecentres provide rural farmers with data on agricultural practices, the cost and availability of farm inputs (pesticides, fertilizers and seeds), health and life insurance, welfare opportunities and other useful information. E-commerce has also found a niche in some rural areas in India. Electronic commerce, or e-commerce, involves the sale or purchase of goods or services over computer-mediated networks, particularly the Internet. Such goods and services may be ordered from anywhere in the globe. For example, one village in Tamil Nadu, which excels in making traditional cotton saris and other garments, sells its products to buyers all over the world through a web site operated by a US based NGO called PEOPLink (www.peoplinc.org). Telecentre services in Pondicherry have encouraged villagers to utilise their considerable knowledge of local herbs for the establishment of a herb-processing centre. Using the services of the telecentre, the villagers have learned how to package and market the herbs.

The new information and communication technologies are widely used for promoting education and higher learning in India. The Internet currently hosts thousands of distance-learning and training programmes on virtually any conceivable subject. IGNOU, for example offers many academic programmes through Internet. Also it has widely integrated new ICTs into its day to day functioning, such as admission procedures, publication of results, library facilities etc.

Box 16.2: The Gyandoot project in India: a breakthrough in e-government

The Gyandoot project has been recognised as a breakthrough in e-government, winning the Stockholm Challenge IT Award 2000 in the area of public service and democracy. The project gives marginalised tribal people in central India their first-ever chance to access knowledge electronically. Dhar district in Madhya Pradesh State has a population of approximately 1.7 million people, most of whom are poor and marginalised. About 60 per cent of the people live below the poverty line and most are illiterate. They depend on small farm production and are often subject to exploitation by middlemen, local moneylenders and corrupt officials. The Gyandoot project installed a computer network connecting 31 village centres and made use of ICT to provide various online services, including (a) land revenue-related transactions, (b) public grievance redressal, (c) village auction, (d) a matrimonial site, (e) government services and entitlements, (f) expert consultation, (g) a free e-mail facility on social issues, (h) employment news and (i) a village newspaper. The benefits of the project reached over a half million people. The improved citizen-government interface has enabled interaction and dialogue, the formation of new alliances, the development of interpersonal networks and the establishment of cross-sectoral links. Greater access and control over information have empowered the community and resulted in better governance.

Source: <http://www.challenge.stockholm.se/projects.asp>

India still has a long way to go in making ICTs widely available to its population. A digital divide in terms of accessibility of latest technologies to vast majority of Indian population widely persist even today. The digital divide is persistent in terms of the geographical location, educational attainment, income divide, skill attainment etc. To large extent ICT penetration in India has occurred in urban areas only. The rural India where more than 90% of Indian population lives is largely excluded form these developments. There are also various other social factors such as caste, religion, and class etc. still rules the Indian social structure which facilitates the existence of inequalities in the society and this in turn reflects in the ICTs induced development as well.

16.7 Poverty Estimates and Poverty Eradication Measures During the Reform Period

Poverty in India is a predominantly rural phenomenon. More than three quarters of poor people in India live in rural areas. Also there is wide variation in poverty across different states. Moreover progress in reducing poverty is also very uneven across different regions. Based on the data collected by Economic Survey, Dev and Ranade (1999) makes a comparison of poverty situation in pre- and post-reform period. According to them

- Rural and urban poverty increased during the first two years of the reform period.
- The phenomenon of faster decline of rural poverty in the 1980s have been halted in the post 1991 period.
- There has been a decline in the absolute number of poor in in the 1980s. In contrast, post-1991 period showed an increase in the absolute number of poor.
- Urban poverty declined much faster than rural poverty in the post-reform period.

They reach the conclusion that the impact of economic reforms on the poor in India has been better than in some Latin American countries, but worse than in some of the East Asian countries (Dev and Ranade1999).

Table 16.1 Poverty rates in India since 1973

Year	All India,%	Rural , %	Urban, %
1973	54.9	56.4	49.0
1978	51.3	53.1	45.2
1983	44.5	45.7	40,8
1988	38.9	39.1	38.2
1994	36.0	37.3	32.4
1999	26.1	27.1	23.6

Source: Economic Survey 2000-2001

Government of India adopted several poverty alleviation programme to help the poor to improve their economic, physical and social conditions. These programmes are directly targeted at the poor and the benefits from them would accrue to the poor from the normal economic activities. The programmes, which aimed at directly helping the poor instead of the entire population, are termed as targeted poverty alleviation programme. The rationale for targeting the poor for development programmes is that the benefits or social returns are higher for the population at the lower end of the income distribution than at the upper end.

The existing major programmes for the poor in India can be roughly categorised into three. i) wage employment programme ii) credit-based self employment programme iii) the public distribution system and the nutrition programme.

Economic reforms and impact on poverty eradication:

One of the impact of opening up of the economy has seen the resurgence of the importance of large metropolitan cities. Private investment, both foreign and Indian have tend to be concentrated in and around these large cities (Shaw 1999). The local governments for attracting these investments offered a range of incentives to private investors. The large metropolitan cities are undergoing a facelift exercise as part of the city cleaning, beautification and pollution control programmes. While the city spaces are being increasingly acquired by the private commercial and service industry establishments the poorest, mainly the slum dwellers, hawkers, destitutes, street dwellers are being pushed out of the city to the peripheries (Kundu 1997). The city peripheries are getting degenerated with low value employment, poor living condition, thus making lot of the urban poor worse.

Opening-up in the developing economies was primarily visualised as a mechanism where trade would function as ‘an engine of growth’ and the fruits of growth would ‘trickle down’ to the poor. However, the results had been mixed, with many countries observing widening inequality in their economies, contrary to the conventional trade theory prescriptions (Bardhan 2001).

The internationalisation of trade has opened up vistas for globalisation of production creating profound changes in the labour market, such as widening wage disparity, increasing contractualisation of work, skill based segregation of work etc. As per the 1991 census 90% of the Indian workforce is in the unorganised sector. There is hardly any legal backing, social spending, or any form of support to this class of workers who are the poorest among all groups of workers. They do not have any collective bargaining capacity with an institutional backing. For the vast majority of them there is no fixed place of work, no fixed working hours, no regular wages, no job security. Thus they have become one of the most vulnerable to poverty. Globalisation is argued to be ‘informalising’ and ‘casualising’ the employment opportunities in the economy thus further expanding the unorganised form of employment. It is seen that the economic reforms only vitiated this sector.

Reflection and Action 16.8

Do you think that the economic reforms in India for the last one and a half century facilitated the eradication of poverty in our society? Give valid reasons to justify your answer.

The social sector spending as a proportion to GDP had been stagnant in the 1990s and there had been a definite shift away from rural development (Dev and Mooij, 2002). The share of health expenditure had been stagnant and that on education had been declining. The government is further trying to reduce the size of current expenditure by shrinking the accounts on pensions, subsidies etc. The reduction in the social sector expenditure (for more details refer unit 21) had a negative impact on the poverty eradication programmes.

Though poverty has declined at the macro level, with a significant decline in the proportion of people living below the poverty line from 51.3 percent in 1977-78 to 28.1 percent in 1999-2000, there are wide rural-urban and inter-state disparities in the improvement pattern. In 1999-2000 Bihar and Orissa continued to be the two poorest States. In 1999-2000, twenty States and union territories had poverty ratios below the national average.

The Tenth Plan (2002-2007) has set a target of reduction in poverty ratio by five percentage points to 19.3 percent by 2007 and by 15 percentage points by 2012. The targets for rural and urban poverty in 2007 are 21.1 percent and 15.1 percent respectively. Closely related to poverty is the issue of unemployment. There are large inter-state differentials in unemployment. During the period 1993-94 to 1999-2000, growth in employment was the highest in Haryana (2.43 percent) followed by Gujarat (2.31 percent), while Kerala recorded the least growth of only .07 percent.

16.8 Development and Social Sectors

When it comes to education, India shows a rise from 18.3 percent in 1951, to 64.8 percent in 2001 but even then it continues to lag being several other developing countries in the region, as shown in Table 16.3.

The National Policy on Education (1986) provides a broad policy framework for eradication of illiteracy and in order to fulfill the goal of universal elementary education, the Constitution (86th Amendment) Act, 2002, has been passed by Parliament. A comprehensive program called Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), launched in November 2000, aims to improve the performance of the school system through a community owned approach and to impart quality elementary education to all children in the age group of 6-14 by 2010.

Table 16.2: Literacy rates in India (1951-2001)

Census Year	Persons	Males	Females	Male-Female gap in literacy Rate
1951	18.33	2.16	8.86	18.30
1961	28.30	40.40	15.35	25.05
1971	34.45	45.96	21.97	23.98
1981	43.57	56.38	29.76	26.62
1991	52.21	64.13	39.29	24.84
2001	64.84	75.85	54.16	21.69

Source: Census of India
(A.R. Khan, 2003: 85)

Table 16.3: India's global position on adult and youth literacy rates

Country	Adult Literacy Rate (percent 15 years & above)		Youth Literacy Rate (percent 15-24 years & above)	
	1990	2001	1990	2001
China	78.3	85.8	95.3	97.9
India	49.3	58.0	64.3	73.3
Nepal	30.4	42.9	46.6	61.6
Pakistan	35.4	44.0	47.4	57.8
Sri Lanka	88.7	91.9	95.1	96.9
Bangladesh	34.2	40.6	42.0	49.1

Source: UNDP 2003

The National Program for Education of Girls at Elementary Level (NPEGEL) has been launched in 2003-04 for providing additional components for education of girls at elementary level under SSA. The number of primary schools increased from 6.39 lakh in 2000-01 to 6.64 lakh in 2001-02. The National Literacy Mission was launched on May 5, 1988, as a Technology Mission to impart functional literacy to non-literates in the country in the age group of 15-35 years in a time-bound manner. The National Education Policy, 1986, as modified in 1992, also has recognised the National Literacy Mission as one of the three instruments to eradicate illiteracy from the country, the other two being universalisation of Elementary Education and Non-formal Education.

Population and Family Welfare

The population of India, according to the population census of India, 2001, was 1,027 million, with 531 million males and 496 million females. Presently, India is going through the phase of "high birth rate-low death rate". While the crude birth rate, over the last two decades, declined from 33.9 per thousand persons in 1981 to 25 per thousand persons in 2002, the crude death rate also declined from 12.5 per thousand persons in 1981 to 8.1 per thousand persons in 2002.

Providing good health condition (National Health Policy, 2002), safe drinking water and low cost sanitation, are some of the aims of the policies and programmes of the Government. Another issue, which is central to the welfare of the family, is development of women and children. Though women constitute about 48 percent of the total population of the country, they suffer many disadvantages as compared to men. Various schemes have been introduced under the "National Policy for Empowerment of Women", 2001, to ensure the right place to women in society. The Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) scheme was first launched in 33 selected blocks in 1975 to promote the overall development of the young children (0-6 years). At the same time, a number of schemes have been introduced to improve the lot of socially disadvantaged groups – the Scheduled Castes (SCs), the other Backward Classes (OBCs) and the Minorities.

Reflection and Action 16.5

What are the different areas of human and social sector where the mode of development should focus on?

16.9 Conclusion

Compared to the state of economic stagnation in the decades before independence India has come a long way ahead in terms of economic, social and human progress. In the first half of the unit we have seen the development

approach that India followed since independence till early 1990s, which was a turning point for India economy. India decided to go in the path of globalisation, liberalisation and privatisation with the adoption of New Economic Policy in 1991. The second half of the unit deals with the shifts that have taken place in the trade, finance and industrial sector since 1991. Also an evaluation of the reforms in various economic and social sectors. Such an assessment leads to the conclusion that economic progress is not the only priority of the economic policies of India, but human and social development also are equally important. India has to achieve a lot more in relation to economic, human and social progress of her people.

16.10 Further Reading

Khan, A.R. 2003. *Economic Survey (2003-04)*. V.P.G. Books Delhi

Kapila, Uma (ed.) 2001. *Indian Economy Since Independence*. Academic Foundation: New Delhi

Rakshit Mihir (ed.) 1998. *Studies in Macroeconomics in Developing Countries*
OUP: New Delhi

Unit 30

Civil Society Movements and Grassroots Initiatives

Contents

- 30.1 Introduction
- 30.2 Civil Society: Meanings and Dimensions
- 30.3 Civil Society as Social Movements
- 30.4 Non-Governmental Organisations as Civil Society Actors
- 30.5 Relationship Between NGOs and the Government
- 30.6 Marginalisation and the Marginalised People
- 30.7 Civil Society and Empowerment of the Marginalised
- 30.8 Civil Society Movements: A Critique
- 30.9 Conclusion
- 30.10 Further Reading

Learning Objectives

This Unit will help you examine critically:

- meanings and dimensions of civil society;
- civil society as social movements;
- non-governmental organisations (NGOs) as civil society actors;
- relationship between NGOs and the government organisations; and
- role of civil society for empowerment of marginalised.

30.1 Introduction

In Unit 1 of Book 1 of this course we have briefly talked about the emerging role of civil society in contemporary development practices. In this unit we shall be discussing in detail the meanings and dimensions of civil society; its changing role and status in developmental processes. Civil society itself has emerged as a social movement in recent years, while it has always been part of larger social movements in society. The interface between the civil society and social movement has been a subject matter of curiosity to sociologists. We shall discuss this facet of civil society in this unit. Along with the state and the people, civil society has emerged as a partner of development.

The World Development Summit 1995 emphasised the role of civil society in the empowerment of the marginalised. Here, besides discussing civil society as a social movement, this unit also analyses the role of civil society in the empowerment of the marginalised people in society. While we are discussing marginalised people, it is imperative to discuss the process of marginalisation. A small discussion on the marginalisation and empowerment of the marginalised people is also part of this unit. This unit will also provide you a critical overview of civil society's role in development.

30.2 Civil Society: Meanings and Dimensions

The term civil society is derived from the Latin word *civilis societas* which means associations or communities that work above and beyond the state. Civil society thus consists of a host of institutions that look after the activities,

which are not taken up by the state. These may relate to various religious, cultural, economic and other activities of society.

The medieval church of Europe, Hindu *Maths*, Sikh *Gurdwaras*, Muslim *Mosques*, and other religious trusts in India, caste and kinship associations, business, sports, cultural associations, etc., represent the civil society.

It is important that civil society is also referred to for its moral value and authority; as the state is more akin to an administrative unit. Civil society, in opposition to the state, lays the moral foundation of society (NSI 1996). It is in this sense that civil society has widely been viewed as an epitome not only of moral authority but also as a bastion of culture against the state, the law and capitalism. However the dimension of opposition in civil society has been in a state of flux as its relationship with the state, the market and capitalism has not always been the same everywhere and every time. However, today we tend to see civil society as the home of culture, of freedom, of independence (all good things), which enables us to rein in the state (which can do us harm if permitted) (Ibid 1996).

Importantly, Civil society has long been playing a pivotal role in influencing the state's policy on social welfare, articulating views on current issues, serving as the voice of constructive debate, providing a forum for the exchange of new ideas and information, initiating social movements by way of creating new norms, identities, institutions (Cohen and Arato 1994). Civil society is, together with the state and the market, one of the three *spheres* that interface in the making of democratic societies.

Civil society is the sphere in which social movements become organised. The organisation of civil society, which represents many diverse and sometimes contradictory social interests, is shaped to fit the social base, constituency, thematic orientations (e.g. environment, gender, human rights) and types of activity. They include church related groups, trade unions, cooperatives, service organisation, community groups and youth organisations as well as academic institutions (UNDP 1993:1). Civic involvement has always been an inseparable part of the development process of human society. In Putnam's argument, higher levels of civil involvement gives rise to "social capital" which in turn makes possible more civic involvement (Putnam 1993).

In Gramscian (1998) sense, civil society is the terrain where the state, the people and the market interact and where people wage war against the hegemony of the market and the state. The status of civil society organisations has been widely explained in terms of their relationship with the state and the market. In Tocqueville's view, civil society represents a vision of politics and democracy that is non-state centered and that has taken root in contemporary social movements and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) (Smith 2001). However to the liberals and the neo-liberals, civil society is organised around the market economy (Taylor 1990) as a non-political privatised delivery system for services such as welfare, education, healthcare, clean water and so on. In recent years there has been a phenomenal proliferation of the civil societies all over the globe. Social scientists have attributed this phenomenon to the crises in the states on the one hand and the market triumph on the other. At times the state is beset with a legitimisation deficit that destroys the conditions of its own stability, paving the way for the civil society (Chandhoke 1995).

Notwithstanding such a debate on the pro or anti State stand of civil societies or that of State failure of legitimisation crises, civil societies have been viewed as a force for democratisation, counterweights to the state and economic power and have emerged as alternative vehicles of citizens' participation at both the national and transnational levels of governance. Their activism and

initiatives have also been viewed as a movement for transformation of regional, national and global politics and economics (Edwards 2000). Many scholars, however, see the civil society beyond the state and market syndrome, as the state and the market contribute something, but not everything towards the cohesion and the dynamics of the society (Beteille 2000).

Indeed there is a need to view the civil society both as a structure (of organisation, social and political space and relationship) and also as a process (the ways in which the elements of structure come into being, and interrelate)(Blaney and Pasha 1992). In the wake of globalisation, introduction of the structural adjustment programme and paradigm shift in the social development strategy there has been an attempt to redefine the role of the state and the civil society. In the emerging scenario the emphasis has been a) on the increasing roles of the civil societies “ to take the burden off the state, by involving citizens and communities in the delivery of the collective goods” (World Bank 1997:3), and b) on “strengthening of the abilities and opportunities of civil society and local communities” to ensure the process of empowerment of the marginalised in society (UN 1995). However, in the contemporary development discourse, there has been a process of involvement of civil society organisations along with the state in the formulation and implementation of development initiatives. What have been the relationships of the civil society with the people on the one hand and the state on the other? We shall discuss this issue in the following sections of this unit. Let us begin with the relationship of civil society with social movements.

Reflections and Actions 30.1

What do you mean by civil society? Can a civil society be described independent of the existence of the state?

30.3 Civil Society as Social Movements

In the last block of MSO-004 we shall be discussing in detail various aspects of social movements and their transformation. In this section let us know very briefly what we mean by social movements and what are the relationships between social movements and civil society, initiatives or activisms. Conventionally, social movements have broadly been perceived as organised efforts to bring about changes in the thought, beliefs, values, attitudes, relationships and major institutions in society, or to resist changes in any of the above structural elements of society (H. Blumer 1976; H. Toch 1956; Habermas 1972; J.R. Gusfield 1972, J. Wilson 1972). Social movements are viewed as intended and organised collective actions based on certain defined aims, methodology for collective mobilisation, distinctive ideology, identified leadership and organisation. However, since the late 1960s, especially in the wake of the proliferation of new forms of collective protest, resistance and mobilisation, like the students, environmental, Black civil rights, women's, etc., movements in the United States and Western Europe, efforts have been made to identify new elements in social movements. It has been widely recognised that social movements help to generate a sense of collective identity and new ideas that recognise the reality itself. And redefine modes of collective existence and Melucci (1996) has emphasised on collective identity formation. To him, social movements grow around relationships of new social identity that are voluntarily conceived “to empower” members in defense of this identity (Melucci 1996). Eyerman and Jamison (1991) highlight that:

by articulating consciousness, the social movement provides public spaces for generating new thoughts, activating new actors, generating new ideas. Thus by producing new knowledge, by reflecting on their own cognitive identity, by saying what they stand for, by challenging

the dominant assumptions of the social order, social movements develop new ideas that are fundamental to the process of human creativity. Thus social movements develop worldviews that restructure cognition, that recognise reality itself. The cognitive praxis of social movements is an important source of new social images and transformation of societal identities (Eyerman and Jamison 1991: 161-66).

Social movements are framed based on a collective identity of various groups, namely, women, environmentalists, students, peasants, workers, etc., who are organised on the basis of common identity and interests. To Allan Scott (1990), in a social movement the actor's collective identity is linked to his or her understanding of their social situation. To him "a social movement is a collective actor constituted by individuals who understand themselves to have a common interest, and at least some significant part of their social existence, a common identity" (Allan Scott 1990: 6).

However, participation in social movements may not always be for the quest of an identity; rather, it may be for the gratification of political and material interests. Tilly (1978), McAdam (1982), Tarrow (1994) and many others are of the view that social movements manifest in response to the increase in the potential political opportunities and growing receptivity of the state to the activities of the challenging groups. In general, these scholars emphasise the various resources involved in the manifestation and operationalisation of social movements. This approach, known as resource mobilisation, assumes that collective actions are related to the specific opportunity structures. Here importance is given on the rationality of human action, whereby the participants in the social movement calculate the costs and benefits of their participatory action in collective mobilisation. In this approach social movements are seen either as the creation of entrepreneurs skillful in the manipulation or mobilisation of social resources or the playing out of the social tensions and conflicts. Thus the motivation of the actors is seen as rational economic action. The resource mobilisation theory, indeed, aims to interpret those sets of social movements that are the visible parts of the American social reality in management terms. It is linked to the policy problem of containment (Tilly 1978: 47).

Civil Society and Social Movement: The Interface

In the context of globalisation or otherwise there have been claims of universality of civil societies. It is argued at one point that specific economic, social and political conditions influence the growth and functioning of the civil societies and thereby it can't be universal. On the other hand, there has been the argument that as there have been universal processes like modernisation, secularisation, democratisation, globalisations and so on, the claim of universality of civil society has emerged to be a reality. In view of the emergence of global social movements viz. human right, animal right, ecological and environmental etc. global civil society has been a reality. Phenomenal expansion of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) has smothered the global emergence and networking of civil societies as a social movement. In this backdrop, let us examine the interface between civil society and social movements. There are important parallels between social movements and civil society initiatives. It is rather at times pointed out that civil society initiative is a variant of social movements. Here, before we go into identifying this variant(s), we should know the parallels.

- Both social movements and civil societies are having structures like organisations, a well-identified leadership and ideology.
- Civil society initiatives and social movements are social processes, which undergo several stages of progression from mobilisation to intensive collective action.
- Both structures and the processes have support bases or bodies of followers who are mobilised through diverse means to get their objectives fulfilled.

- In general both social movements and civil societies pledge for change in established order of the society. However, many civil societies or social movements also well work to resist change in society. For example, many religious organisations pledge for the fundamentalist position in society.
- Both civil society and the social movement occupy a civil space in society.
- The creation of a new collective identity is an essential part both of social movements and civil societies. Collective identities are evolved either based on certain issues or ideological choices. However, identities also get reconstructed or transformed through the processes of sustained mobilisation.
- Though a good deal of moral authority and idealism are attached to civil society activism and to social movements, at times both these processes are initiated by enterprising people for the maximisation of specific interests. Here both processes are amenable to caption by the state.

However, notwithstanding these parallels, social movements are broader categories or agencies. At times social movements look for a radical change by attacking the pre-existing power structure of society, e.g., the Naxalite movement. Civil society, on the other hand, looks for gradual change within the existing arrangement. Though civil society initiatives tend to be apolitical, many a time they ask political questions and political solutions through developmental activities. Indeed in the contemporary development discourse of development with empowerment, civil society division is very much involved in the political issues at the grassroots.

Reflection and Action 30.2

Analyse the characteristic features of social movements. What are the linkages between social movements and civil societies?

30.4 Non-Governmental Organisations as Civil Society Actors

It has been pointed out in the first section of this unit that there are several manifestations of civil society. So far as the developmental activities are concerned, Non-Government Organisations (NGOs) have emerged as important civil society actors at the grassroots. Let us examine some of its features.

The non-governmental organisation or the private voluntary organisations are basically non-profit making bodies whose primary aim is to contribute to the reduction of human sufferings and the development of the poor and the marginalised groups. They are an integral part of both the national and global civil society as they include both local communities, cooperatives, church groups, trade unions, environment groups and consumer associations, women's groups, peasant leagues, as well as international organisations like Amnesty International, Oxfam, Friends of the Earth, etc. These organisations are best known for their relief, educational, lobbying, human rights, health, employment generation, and poverty reduction activities. They are growing at a very fast rate in the developing parts of the world due to the increasing disillusionment especially of the poor with the government. The market has also failed to serve the interests of these vulnerable sections of the population. As a result many hopes have been placed on the NGOs, also known as the "third sector".

NGOs are conceptualised as non-profit and non-governmental organisations. Anheier and Salaman (1999) highlight some of the common characteristics of NGOs. According to them NGOs are:

- organisations, i.e., they have an institutional presence and structure;
- private, i.e., they are institutionally separate from the state;
- non-profit distributing, i.e., they do not return profits to their managers or to a set of owners;
- self-governing, i.e., they are fundamentally in control of their own affair; and
- voluntary, i.e., membership in them is not legally required and they attract some level of voluntary contribution of time or money”.

It is significant that the element of private is to be understood in a very limited sense. It means that NGOs are neither part of the government apparatus and public administration nor are they dominated by public officials (Anheier and Salaman cf. Symthe and Smith 2003). Nor are they a private enterprise to earn profit. Indeed they have the social objective of providing selfless service to the millions, especially in those areas of activity where the state has either not been able to reach out, or has not been effective in providing service as per the local requirement and has withdrawn. At times the state has looked for collaborative arrangement with the NGOs to provide much needed service to the people, especially to the marginalised section of society.

Paul Streeten (1998), after examining the functioning of the NGOs in the developing societies, claims that NGOs have certain advantages in promoting development at the grassroots. This is mostly because of the fact that

- NGOs are good for reaching and mobilising the poor and remote communities.
- NGOs are participatory in their approach and follow a ‘bottom up’ strategy for the implementation of projects at the grassroots.
- They are more innovative, flexible and experimental than the government’s agencies.
- The NGOs’ projects are cost effective and efficient.
- The NGOs promote sustainable development.
- They are potentially organising and representative bodies in civil societies.

However, there has been a wide gap between the ideal image of NGOs and their modes of functioning at the grassroots. Indeed, the ideal-typical image of the NGOs has been widely demystified by several researchers. It has been pointed out that even though the NGOs work in the name of the poor, in effective terms they reinforce the rule of the power elite, incur a higher administrative cost, impose an autocratic, top down and non-participatory approach to development. Again, NGOs are not financially independent. As most of the NGOs flourished under a charismatic leadership or are a body of dedicated workers, many of the project, collapse with the disappearance of such leaders and workers. It has also been pointed out that NGOs have no clear-cut objectives that they suffer from the problems of sustainability, and non-replicability; and being small they reach only a few people in developing countries. They fail to reach 80% of the 1.3 billion estimated to be living in extreme poverty. Even the much publicised Grameen Bank of Bangladesh, often cited as a model NGO, accounts for only 0.15% of national credit and all NGOs in Bangladesh together provide only 0.6% of total Credit (Streeten 1998 112-113).

It is important to mention that NGOs are to work in a context and to interact with various forces. They are largely dependent on the government and the international agencies for funds. They are also to interact with the local level politicians. At times their plans and programmes are framed, modified and executed under the influence of these politicians. NGOs’ activities are also conditioned by localised culture and values of the marginalised people among

whom they are working. In the following section of this unit we shall be discussing the relationship of the NGOs with the government rather than with marginalised people.

Reflection and Action 30.3

Discuss the major features of NGOs and their advantages and disadvantages in representing the cause of downtrodden.

30.5 Relationship Between NGOs and the Government

The relationship between NGOs and the government has been rather very complex in recent years. While on the one hand there have been more and more recognition and encouragement for the NGOs' activism by the government, there have been severe criticisms of the government agencies by the NGOs for their rigid bureaucratic and traditional outlook. The government has also been trying to make the NGOs accountable to its, and to the law of the land, to ensure transparency in financial dealings, etc. The NGOs are also trying to make government officials, accountable to the people, to ensure impartial functioning of state organs at the grassroots level. However notwithstanding the contradictory position, there have been several areas of cooperation between the government and NGOs.

NGOs are mostly working on the legalised issues and on a small scale. The state policies on area development, desert development, tribal development, women's development etc., which are addressed at a local level need a vast body of local inputs and resources. The experience and the expertise of the localised NGOs usually come to help in a big way for the successful implementation of these policies. Again the NGOs also formulate innovative projects on these issues receiving expert help from government agencies (Streeten 1998). According to an estimate there are over 30,000 NGOs in India. The Indian state was initially indifferent if not hostile to NGOs' activism. The situation has changed since the Eighth Five Year Plan 1992-1997, and now the government openly encourages the participation of NGOs in development sphere (Bavaskar 2004).

However NGOs' relationship with the state has widely been dichotomous in nature. Though many of them supplement government plans and programmes, they are also simultaneously critical of government policies. Again, while on the one hand they have been defined in terms of negation of the state, on the other they have remained widely dependent on the state for funds. Policies of the NGOs are also at times guided and framed by state policies.

In recent decades there has been a process of internationalisation of NGOs' activism. While working on local and national issues, the NGOs have started getting serious attention and recognition from international agencies. At the international level, many NGOs also take part in the transnational campaign against various social evils like drug addiction, poverty, illiteracy, HIV/AIDS, child abuse, women's rights, environment protection, disarmament, violation of human rights, etc. NGOs also educate people in influencing government policies on several international issues. In the process of undertaking all these initiatives, NGOs have been part of global networking.

Over the years there has been a phenomenal growth of the transaction NGOs, with more working at the global level with larger issues. One of the reasons for such growth has been the crisis in the State caused by massive state deficits, financial crisis and economic restructuring. As the state functioning is going to be restructured along the lines of the corporate market model, and it is also withdrawing from the social sector, NGOs are emerging as important stakeholders and providers of services to the marginalised people.

In the developing countries many NGOs function by receiving funds from foreign agencies. There has also been a tendency to ignore the law of the land by these NGOs. Here serious questions are raised not only by academicians and policy planners but also by the common people on their accountability and mode of spending.

30.6 Marginalisation and the Marginalised People

In developing countries like India, civil societies like NGOs play a crucial role for the social development of the marginalised people. Again these groups of people have also developed a sense of expectations from the NGOs as the state-sponsored development initiatives have miserably failed to elevate their status in society. As discussed in an earlier section, in the contemporary development discourse, the concept of empowerment of the marginalised has got a special focus and civil society initiatives have been given an emphasis. As the role of civil society has acquired a special significance for the social development and the empowerment of the marginalised people, and it has developed a substantive relationship with them let us discuss first who are the marginalised people and how the developmental processes have contributed to their marginalisation in society.

Marginalisation in conventional parlance is a complex process of relegating specific group(s) of people to the lower or outer edge of society. It effectively pushes these groups of people to the margin of society economically, politically, culturally, and socially following the parameters of exclusion and inclusion. Sociologically there are several important dimensions of marginalisation and one is to understand it in the larger context:

Dimensions of denials and deprivations: The process of marginalisation economically denies a large section of society equal access to productive resources, avenues for the realisation of their productive human potential, and opportunities of their full capacity utilisation. These denials ultimately push these populations to the state of rampant poverty, human misery, devaluation of their work, low wage and wage discrimination, casualisation in the workforce, and livelihood insecurity. Thus they are provided with very limited space for upward occupational and social mobility, and are excluded from the range of economic opportunities and choices. Politically, this process of relegation denies these people equal access to the formal power structure and participation in the decision-making processes leading to their subordination to and dependence on the economically and politically dominant groups of society. Politically they emerge to be the underdogs, un/under represented and disempowered. In the continuous process of this relegation, they emerge to be culturally excluded from the mainstream of society becoming "part society with part culture", "outsider for within", "alienated and disintegrated". They eventually get a stigmatised cultural existence, an ascribed low social status and become the victims of cultural segregation. As a consequence of the economic, political and cultural deprivation, a vast chunk of the population of the country has emerged to be socially ignorant, illiterate, uneducated and dependent. Devoid of the basic necessities of life they are relegated to live on the margins of society with a subhuman existence.

Artificial structure of hierarchy: Indeed marginalisation is a man-made and socially constructed process which is permuted and continuously reproduced on the basis of an unequal relationship of dependency and domination. In this context, even the natural differentiation between men and women, linguistic or ethnic groups and so on are put in an order of hierarchy with the guiding principle of domination and subordination. This process of creating hierarchy has arranged social groups in steep ordering of people, with a powerful few at the social and economic command deciding the mainstream of the society, polity and the economy. On the other hand, within the same arrangement the vast majority has remained powerless, occupying the bottom of the socio-economic hierarchy and surviving at the periphery of the social order.

Bases of legitimacy and reproduction: The process of marginalisation has also been historically embedded in a socio-cultural context. Significantly there are strong institutional, normative and ideological bases, steaming out of the primordial interpretation of the institutional and normative arrangements of caste, ethnicity, race, gender, patriarchy, religion and so on, to provide legitimacy to the processes of marginalisation. Again, the ongoing processes of socialisation, education, politicisation, enculturation, etc., contribute to their reproduction in society. Thus, over a period of time, the socially constructed marginalised categories tend to appear to be the empirical categories, viz., the low castes, tribes, women, blacks and so on.

Development strategy and marginalisation: The development strategies, which were implemented within the pre-existing structural arrangements of society, have not been able to bring an end to the deprivation of the marginalised groups, rather than have largely contributed to the social reproduction of marginalisation.

The *Human Development Report* 1990 highlighted ruthless, voiceless, jobless, futureless facts of development. Indeed the marginalised people have emerged to be the major victim of these processes of development. In every human society there are vulnerable sections of marginalised population who are deprived of socio-economic opportunities and choices for their minimum sustenance, and are victims of the artificial structure of hierarchy and social, cultural and political exclusion. In the Indian context, marginalised people are the rural poor, urban, slum-dwellers, manual workers in unorganised sectors, scheduled castes, tribes, women, and other such categories.

An analysis of historical facts reveals that the pre-existing arrangement of distribution of power is hierarchical in nature. This process of hierarchisation has arranged social groups in the steep ordering of people with a powerful "few" at the social and economic command, deciding the mainstream of the society, polity and the economy. On the other hand, within the same arrangement, the vast majority have remained powerless, occupying the bottom of the socio-economic hierarchy and surviving at the periphery or the margin of the social order. Here power as an enabling provision has deprived the powerless of the chance to decide the course of their lives by themselves.

As conventionally development initiatives were implemented through the pre-existing institutional arrangements of society, the marginalised people had very little or no participation in those developmental activities. Again, those initiatives were channelled through the pre-existing power structure. The systemic arrangements have not only legitimised the process of their subordination and deprivation in society through several means, but also contributed to the process of reproduction of this inequality and social construction of marginalisation. Thus the process of marginalisation has remained historically imbedded, notwithstanding the state sponsored initiatives implemented for the upward mobility of the marginalised groups. As against this backdrop, there has been serious rethinking for the participation of the marginalised people in development. As the welfare or emancipation approach of the state has failed to integrate the marginalised people in the development process, an alternative has emerged to evolve the strategy for empowerment of the marginalised people. Let us explain in the next section what we mean by empowerment.

30.7 Civil Society and Empowerment of the Marginalised

Empowerment is a political process. Before we go into conceptualising empowerment, it is necessary to develop an understanding of the following interrelated dimensions of this process.

Dimensions of Legitimacy of Power: The centrality of the notion of empowerment is located in the dynamics of sharing, distribution and redistribution of power, which has a basis of legitimacy. In the sociological sense of Max Weber, power is one's capacity to have control over others; and as such, when this capacity to control is legitimised, it becomes authority (Julien 1968). Indeed the logic of empowerment essentially involves the dynamics of authority. While one talks of the process of distribution/redistribution of authority or in that sense legitimised power, one naturally questions not only the bases of legitimacy for the authority, but also the societal arrangements through which power relations are operated. Following the same logic, powerlessness has also been legitimised within the given social order. Hence empowerment will mean a process of distribution of power through legitimised means.

Context of Use: While talking of authority (legitimised power) as the accompaniment of empowerment, James Herrick (1995) points out that authority in general is used in the following contexts: a) regulatory, based on one's formal position and status in relation to others; b) expert knowledge, where the expert may possess the power to define ordinary people or to withhold knowledge from those whose well-being is affected by it; and c) relationship ability or interpersonal skills, where power comes from interpersonal influence based on abilities to work with people. In human society, however everybody has no equal authority as people have unequal access to the resources that determine power. Indeed, those who have power are those who have control over material resources, knowledge and ideology. Hence the process of gaining control over self, ideology, material and knowledge resources, which determine power, may be termed empowerment (*Batliwala* 1993). Thus the process of gaining control over resources is to be seen within the given context of devalued deprivation, structure of hierarchy and the process of legitimisation and reproduction. Indeed the process of empowerment endeavours to construct an alternative context for equal access to the resources that determine power.

Dynamics of Power Relations: The meaning of power in empowerment practice needs to be examined in terms of power relations. First, that there should be the ability to exercise power in a given context as having power is not the same as exercising it. Second, the exercise of power takes in the objective reality of empowerment - the structural conditions that affect the allocation of power; seizing or creating opportunities in the environment, changing structural conditions. Third, power relations can be symmetrical or asymmetrical. Relations of symmetry are those where relatively equal amounts and type of power and authority are exercised and are based on reciprocity. Relations of asymmetry are those involving unequal amount and types of authority and are those of subordination and super-ordination. It is the latter case - power relations of asymmetry, which we suggest is the major stage for empowerment practice (Heller cf. *Herrick* 1995).

Principle of Change and Transformation: The process of empowerment challenges the power structures of subordination. In the words of *Sen and Crown* (1988) empowerment is concerned with the transformation of the structure of subordination. It implies a process of redistribution of power within and between families/societies (or systems) and a process aiming at social equality, which can be achieved only by disempowering some structures, systems and institutions. To Sharma it is having a specific focus for the disadvantaged sections (Sharma 1992: 29). The processes of demolition of the pre-existing structure of subordination and redistribution of power, however, are not automatic. These also involve participatory approaches that enable people to emancipate themselves (Konenburg 1986: 229), a process of the creation of new knowledge (*Colin* 1990), a process of conscientisation (Freire 1972) and new identity formation with alternative sensibility. Indeed the process of empowerment is a social movement that looks for a radical change in the systemic arrangements of society (SinghRoy 1995). Hence empowerment is

viewed not as an end in itself, but as a means to an end – a strategy to bring liberation from all domination. Liberation from all domination, to Freire, is the fundamental theme of this epoch. This liberation is not a mechanical process but the critical thinking of the socio-historical reality of the life; ability to intervene in reality with a commitment is the harbingers of liberation. To quote Freire:

Men emerge from their submersion and acquire the ability to intervene in reality, as it is unveiled. Intervention represents a step forward from emergence, and results from the conscientisation of the situation. Conscientisation is the deepening of the attitude of awareness characteristics of all emergences. By achieving awareness they come to perceive reality differently (*Freire 1972: 81-85*).

In developing countries like India, development practices were geared towards “growth with stability”. In the fifties and early sixties with the basic thrust being for industrialisation, agricultural modernisation and expansion of infrastructure, education and mass communication. However in the backdrop of imbalanced economic development, increased class inequality, gender segregation and sharp downward mobility of a vast section of the population along with increased levels of poverty, illiteracy and ill health, development policy was reoriented in India in the early seventies to incorporate the philosophy of “social justice” in the development discourse. This reorientation of “development with justice” envisaged strategies to integrate the hitherto neglected “underprivileged”, “weaker sections”, “deprived and marginalised groups” into the mainstream of society by providing various state-sponsored economic (employment, access to productive resources, etc.) and social (education, training, healthcare, water, housing, etc.) benefits to them.

The development practice in India has been reoriented once again since the mid-eighties to associate the notion of empowerment with “development”. This reorientation aims at ensuring the basic necessities of life to the people “by sharing power” with them through institutionalised means, i.e., laws, legal procedures and international obligation. The significant point of departure here is that while the earlier discourses saw the poor people as “beneficiaries”, the emergent one has recognised them as “partners of development”. Accordingly there has been a new coinage of the term “social/human development” since the mid-eighties with the recognition that the “human person is the central subject of development” (United Nations 1985). The context of this reorientation, however, has been globalisation and the structural adjustment programme that implicitly or explicitly looks for the reduction of state expenditure in the social sector - health, education, food security and other basic needs – and the encouragement of privatisation. Thus the state has emerged as “central to economic and social development not as a direct provider of growth, but as a partner, catalyst and facilitator” (World Bank 1997).

In this context, it is essential to examine the recommendation of the World Development Summit, 1995 which talks about “people initiatives”, “people empowerment” and “strengthening capacities of the people”. Regarding the objectives of development, it specifically mentions that:

empowering people, particularly women, to strengthen their capacities is the main objective of development and its principal resource. Empowerment requires the full participation of people in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of decisions determining the functioning and well-being of our societies. To ensure full participation of the people, it is pointed out that the state should provide “a stable legal framework” in accordance with the constitutions, laws and procedures consistent with international law and obligation; which promotes, among with other things, the encouragement of “partnership with free and representative organisations of civil society, strengthening of the abilities and opportunities of civil society and local communities to develop their own organisations, resources and activities (UN 1995).

It is in relation to the above that the World Development Report, 1997, emphasised the need on for effective role of the state for social and economic development, but in a new form. It writes:

the state is central to economic and social development, not as a direct provider for growth but as a partner, catalyst and a facilitator ... the world is changing, and with its our ideas about the state's role in economic and social development (World Bank 1997: 1).

In view of the collapse of the command and control economies, fiscal crises of the welfare states, explosion in humanitarian emergencies in several parts of the world, growing lack of confidence in governance among the marginalised groups, endemic corruption within the system, increase in poverty and various dramatic events, especially technological change in the world economy on the one hand and the growing discontent of the people, manifestation of grassroots mobilisation and increasing pressure of the civil society on the other, a redefinition of the state's responsibilities has been evolved as a strategy of the solution of some of these problems. According to the World Bank:

This will include strategic selection of the collective actions that states will try to promote, coupled with greater efforts to take the burden off the state, by involving citizens and communities in the delivery of the collective goods ... for human welfare to be advanced, the state's capacity - defined as the ability to undertake or promote collective actions efficiently, must be increased (ibid: 3).

It is apparent that within the given perspectives of the "stable legal framework", "strategic selection of collective action" (i.e., co-option of grassroots mobilisation) by the state, possible partnership of the state with civil society and state-sponsored initiatives of civil society to have their own organisation, the following three important dimensions have emerged very clearly: a) all initiatives for the empowerment of marginalised groups should be in accordance with the prescribed rule of the land; b) the state will selectively co-opt people's initiatives as and when required, and c) the non-government organisations (NGOs) would acquire a significant role to take the burden off the state for the empowerment of the marginalised.

Reflection and Action 30.4

Examine the role of civil society in empowering the marginalised in our society

The NGOs are claimed to have emerged as equal partners in development along with the state in most parts of the developing world. There is no denying the fact that a small section of NGOs have done substantive work for the social development and empowerment of marginalised groups, opting for various innovative alternative channels of development. The efforts of the Self-employed Women's Association (SEWA), Ahmedabad, and the Bankura Project of the Centre for Women Development Studies (CWDS), New Delhi, may be cited as examples here. However, the experiences of SEWA, CWDS and a few such other institutions do not represent the whole story of NGOs' activism in India. A good section of the NGOs in India have emerged to be the "state in disguise" in many parts of the country mostly because of their hierarchical and bureaucratic structures and style of functioning, conventional outlooks, lack of dynamism and inability to generate a community of "change agents" from among the marginalised people. They mostly produce stereotypes and contribute to the prevailing power structure. Though most NGOs start with the promise of inculcating the "culture of change agents" through their interventions to break the age-old structure of subordination and marginalisation, in actual practice they end up inculcating the culture of "target group" beneficiaries who are passive recipients of benefits of various development schemes. Because of their dependency on the state for funds and other resources, they reinforce the state structure and in turn the various

structures of subordination of marginalised groups. Mr Ashis Kumar, activist of a prominent NGO, articulates his frustration:

It is impossible to act as a change agent or to create a “community of change agents” within the given complexities of our society. The donor agencies have their specific expectations; you are to get your money channelised through government and bureaucracy. You are to negotiate at every stage. At the local level there are power dynamics - you are to accommodate their interest. At the grassroots you are to meet the immediate needs of the people. As an organisation we are to survive within the system.... Indeed we are to compromise at every stage as survival strategy. We are however, sure of one point very clearly that if we can survive within these processes, we can contribute to empowerment of the people by not creating alternatives, but by subscribing to the ongoing processes (cf. SinghaRoy 2001).

30.8 Civil Society Movements: A Critique

Though the NGOs begin with the philosophy of negation of governmental initiatives, they are guided by the economic and social policies of the government. In a system of structural dependency on the state, the NGOs without a committed manpower will provide only a limited space for the creation of alternatives. Many NGOs have even proved their inability to fulfill their commitment to the state. It was in 1996 that Central of Council for Advancement of Peoples Action and Rural Technology (CAPARD) blacklisted around 150 NGOs for not fulfilling their commitment. Though the process of proliferation of NGOs has been very sharp in recent years, their disappearance from the public scene has also been conspicuously marked. To whom are they accountable? To the state? To the people? In a scenario where the NGOs have been unable to either inculcate the culture of “change agents” or to form a new collective identity of marginalised groups at a substantive scale, it is very doubtful whether NGO activism will alone pave the way for the empowerment of marginalised groups. However notwithstanding all the criticisms and limitations, there is no denying of the fact that civil societies have been able to initiate a process of mobilisation at the grassroots. Historical evidence shows that such changes in the pre-existing power structure are possible only through sustained grassroots mobilisations, social movements, selfless interventions of civil societies (NGOs, people’s cooperatives and progressive institutions) and well-articulated alternative policy formulations and their execution with a political commitment for the redressal of power imbalances at the grassroots. After all, the marginalised people cannot stand in isolation on an unequal footing compared with the state (SinghaRoy 2001). Collective mobilisation as a long-term political investment will pave the way for the empowerment of the marginalised. Hence there is a need to view civil society activism not with a vote of negation but constructive criticality.

30.9 Conclusion

In this unit we discussed the role of civil society in the development and empowerment of the marginalised groups in society. In the early part of this unit we discussed the meanings and dimensions of the civil societies and their linkage with social movements. The significance of the NGOs as civil society actors, their relationship with the state and the marginalised people are discussed in detail. In the context of the emerging discourse on “development with empowerment”, the significance of civil societies is critically examined. The unit concludes that as the civil societies have emerged to be an important partner of development along with the state and the people, their roles are to be seen very critically.

30.10 Further Reading

Critique of Knowledge
Society

SighaRoy, D.K. 2003(rpt). *Social Development and the Empowerment of the Marginalised: Perspectives and Strategies*. Sage Publication: New Delhi

Streten, P. 1998. "The Contribution of Non-Governmental Organisations to Development". *In Political Economy Journal of India*. Vol-6 No.2: 111-21

Glossary

Adult Education: Adult education is the practice of teaching and educating adults. It includes organised public educational programs, other than regular full-time and summer elementary and secondary day school that provide opportunities for adult and out-of-school youth who have not graduated to further their education. This is often done in the workplace, or through 'extension' or 'continuing education' courses at secondary schools, or at a college or university or as evening classes.

Agronomists: Agronomists are soils specialists who conduct research in everything from the very basic to the applied issues of soil and water management and land use to improve quality and yield of crops. They study interactions among plants, soils, and the environment. They use sophisticated research tools and techniques to develop new crop hybrids and varieties that grow more efficiently and are more beneficial to society. Agronomists research ways to produce crops and turf, and ways to manage soils in the most environmental friendly way.

Bandwidth: The data transfer capacity of a telecommunications channel, usually expressed in terms of the number of bits per second that can be transmitted (a bit being one unit of information). Narrow bandwidth would correspond to a dial-up modem with 2400 to 56,000 bits per second while broadband can extend to more than 10,000 times this rate.

Biodiversity: Organisms are organised at many levels, ranging from complete ecosystems to the biochemical structures that are the molecular basis of heredity. Biodiversity means the number and variety of different organisms in the ecological complexes in which they naturally occur. A large number of species signifies a healthy atmosphere and characterises the food chain, representing multiple predator-prey relationships.

Biopiracy: Biopiracy refers to the privatisation and unauthorised use of biological resources by entities including corporations, etc. outside of a country, which has pre-existing knowledge. It also means the smuggling of diverse forms of flora and fauna, and the appropriation and monopolisation of traditional population's knowledge and biological resources. Biopiracy causes the loss of control of traditional populations over their resources. Particular activities covered by the term are a) exclusive commercial rights to plants, animals, organs, microorganisms, and genes b) commercialisation of traditional communities' knowledge on biological resources, c) patenting of biological resources.

Broadband Networks: Broadband is a high-speed data transmission capability. It has a transmission speed in excess of 256,000 bits per second in both directions. The term is commonly used to refer to Internet access via cable modems, DSL (JetStream, for example) and increasingly, wireless technologies (WiFi).

Casualisation of Labour: This means expansion of casual/informal employment, which means part-time or temporary or contract employment. They may have to work with minimum wage with no social security cover and trade unionism to raise their work related issues. Casual workers excluded from many of the benefits enjoyed by ongoing, and fixed-term employees, such as legislative protections against unfair dismissal, job security etc.

Counter-culture: In sociology, counterculture is a term used to describe a cultural group whose values and norms are at odds with those of the social mainstream, a cultural equivalent of a political opposition.

Cultural Barriers: Events or occurrences based on culture that create communication problems between individuals from different cultural backgrounds.

Cyberspace: It describes the world of connected computers and the society that gathers around them. The term was coined by author William Gibson in his 1984 novel *Neuromancer*. Cyberspace is now used to describe all of the information available through computer networks and it is commonly known as the Internet.

De-industrialisation: Generally refers to an absolute decline in industrial output or employment rather than simply a decline relative to other sectors of the economy.

De-territorialisation: Some scholars define globalisation in terms of deterritorialisation. For them it is process that entails a reconfiguration of geography, so that social space is no longer mapped in terms of territorial places, territorial distances, or territorial borders (Scholte 2000). Global relations, becomes trans-border exchanges without distance. Such relations are becoming more significant as communication and production increasingly occur without regard to geographic constraints. Transborder organisations of many kinds proliferate, and more people become aware of the world as a single whole.

Devaluation of Currency: Devaluation means the official lowering of the value of one country's currency in terms of one or more foreign currencies as a result of deliberate government action. This also means a reduction in a country's official rate at which one currency is traded for another. Devaluation makes a country's exports cheaper abroad by reducing their prices in terms of foreign currencies and makes imports more expensive by raising their prices in terms of the home currency. Devaluation can provide a short-term boost to an economy encountering balance of payments imbalances, by altering its price competitiveness, but generally has inflationary consequences.

Development Induced Displacement: Development-induced displacement is the forcing of communities and individuals out of their homes, often also their homelands, for the purposes of economic development projects. It is a subset of forced migration. It has been historically associated with the construction of dams for hydroelectric power and irrigation purposes but also appears due to many other development activities, such as mining, infrastructure development etc.

Digital Divide: The term digital divide was coined in the 1990s to describe the perceived growing gap between those who have access to and the skills to use ICT and those who, for socio-economic and/or geographical location, age, gender, culture have limited or no access. There was a particular concern that ICT would exacerbate existing inequalities.

Digitisation: Digitisation generally refers to the process of converting data and information in paper, analog sound tracks, graphics, etc. into binary coded files for the purpose of computer storage and manipulation.

Disinvestment: Disinvestments was a term first used in the 1980s, most commonly in the United States, to refer to the use of a concerted economic boycott designed to pressure the government of South Africa into abolishing its policy of apartheid, which was still in force at that time. In India since 1991 the term is applied to the privatisation of State-held assets by selling out equities.

Drip Irrigation: This is a water-conserving irrigation system where a system of tubes with small holes allow water to drip out onto the root zone of plants. This method results in very little evaporation or runoff, saving water by directing it more precisely, reduced transmission of pathogens, and fewer weeds.

Electronic mail: More often called E-Mail. This is a communication that requires an electronic device for storage and/or transmission. E-mail is a fast, easy, and inexpensive way to communicate with individuals or groups on networked computers and computers equipped for Internet access. Besides basic correspondence, with some systems you can attach and send documents and other files.

Fiscal Deficit: Fiscal deficit is the gap between the government's total spending and the sum of its revenue receipts and non-debt capital receipts. It represents the total amount of borrowed funds required by the government to completely meet its expenditure.

Foreign Exchange Reserve or Forex Reserve: Forex is the market where one currency is traded for another. It is one of the largest markets in the world. Foreign exchange are counted in US dollars. India's "forex reserves" recently passed the 100 billion US\$ mark. India has built up this reserve after an unpleasant incident in the early 1990s, when the country's gold reserve had to be pledged because of a balance of payments crisis.

Fossil Fuel Power: Power generated from coal, oil or natural gas that result from the fossilisation of ancient plants or animals. Fossil fuels are the remains of plant and animal life that are used to provide energy by combustion which are produced by the decomposition of ancient (fossilized) plants and animals. These fuels have taken millions of years to form.

Genetic Diversity: Genetic diversity is heritable variation within and between populations of species. This is a property of a community of organisms of a certain species, in which members of the community have variations in their chromosomes due to a large number of slightly dissimilar ancestors; this property makes the community in general more resistant to diseases or to changing ecological conditions.

Genetic Engineering: This is the technique of removing, modifying, or adding genes to a DNA molecule in order to change the information it contains. By changing this information, genetic engineering changes the type or amount of proteins an organism is capable of producing, thus enabling it to make new substances or perform new functions.

Genetic Pollution: Uncontrolled escape of genetic information into the genomes of organisms in the environment where those genes never existed before. This also means the unintended transfer of genetic material from a genetically engineered organism to one that is not genetically engineered.

Human Capital: The stock of knowledge and skill, embodied in an individual as a result of education, training, and experience, that makes them more productive enable them to derive economic benefits from that. It is the stock of knowledge and skill embodied in the population of an economy. Human capital can be acquired formally, for example through schooling, or informally, for example through on-the-job learning.

Hydraulic System: A system designed to transmit power through a liquid medium, permitting multiplication of force in accordance with Pascal's law, which states that "a pressure exerted on a confined liquid is transmitted undiminished in all directions and acts with equal force on all equal areas." It is a mechanism operated by the resistance offered or the pressure transmitted when a liquid is forced through a small opening or tube.

Indigenous Knowledge: Indigenous knowledge refers to the knowledge belonging to a specific ethnic group, which is unique to a given culture or society. It is the basis for local-level decision-making in agriculture, health care, food preparation, education, natural resource management, and a host of other activities in rural communities. Indigenous information systems are dynamic, and are continually influenced by internal creativity and experimentation as well as by contact with external systems. It is the knowledge that people in a given community have developed over time, and continue to develop. It is based on experience, often tested over centuries of use, adapted to local culture and environment.

Inflation: The rise in price of goods and services, or Consumer Price Index (CPI), when too much money chases too few goods on the market. Moderate inflation is a result of economic growth. Hyperinflation (rising at rates of 100% or more annually) causes people to lose confidence in their economy and put their money in hard assets such as gold and real estate.

Information Processing: Organisations need to process a rapidly growing amount of information. Information processing is the process by which data are handled and stored to ensure the smooth and efficient handling of information. By typing text, entering data into a computer, operating a variety of office machines etc. all grouped into information processing. Those who engaged in information processing jobs are often called as word processors, typists, and data entry keyers, electronic data processors, keypunch technicians, or transcribers.

Intellectual Capital: Is the possession of the knowledge, applied experience, and professional skills which when properly motivated, translated into customer relationships and can provide the organisation with a competitive edge in the marketplace.

Intellectual Property: Intellectual properties are creation of the intellect that has commercial value, including copyrighted property such as literary or artistic works, and ideational property, such as patents, appellations of origin, business methods, and industrial processes. The term often used to refer generically to property rights created through intellectual and/or discovery efforts of a creator that are generally protectable under patent, trademark, copyright, trade secret, trade dress or other law.

As defined by Article 2, section (viii), of the Convention Establishing the World Intellectual Property Organisation, done at Stockholm, July 14, 1967, "intellectual property" shall include the rights relating to: literary, artistic and scientific works, performances of performing artists, phonograms, and broadcasts, inventions in all fields of human endeavor, scientific discoveries, industrial designs, trademarks, service marks, and commercial names and designations, protection against unfair competition, and all other rights resulting from intellectual activity in the industrial, scientific, literary or artistic fields.

Liberalisation: In international terms liberalisation means trade between nations without protective customs tariffs or free trade. This implies trade or commerce carried on without such restrictions as import duties, export bounties, domestic production subsidies, trade quotas, or import licenses. Internal trade liberalisation means loosening of government restrictions in trade related aspects.

Life-long Learning: A continuum of the learning process that takes place at all levels - formal, non-formal and informal - utilising various modalities such as distance learning and conventional learning. This is a broad concept where education that is flexible, diverse and available at different times and places is pursued throughout life.

Livelihood Opportunities: A livelihood comprises the capabilities, assets (stores, resources, claims and access) and activities required for a means of living. The five types of capital asset that comprise a livelihood are financial, physical, natural, social, and human.

Modernisation: Modernisation implies an approach toward the institutions, structures, and values of Western society. Historically modernisation is the process of change toward those types of social, economic and political systems that have developed in Western Europe and

North America from the seventeenth century to the nineteenth and have then spread to other European countries and in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries to the South American, Asian, and African continents (Eisenstadt, S. M. 1966). Generally, the classical modernisation means the historical process of the great changes of the transformation from traditional agricultural to the modern industrial society since the industrial revolution in 18th century.

Molecular Biology: This is a field of biology that studies the molecular level of organization, which means the study of the structure, function, and makeup of biologically important molecules. It studies the molecular basis of life including the biochemistry of molecules such as DNA/RNA and proteins and the molecular structure and function of the various parts of living cells.

Monopoly: Monopoly means exclusive control or possession of something. In economics, a monopoly is defined as a persistent market situation where there is only one provider of a kind of product or service. Monopolies are characterised by a lack of economic competition for the good or service that they provide and a lack of viable substitute goods.

Neo-classical Economics: Neoclassical economics refers to a general approach to economics based on supply and demand, which depends on individuals (or any economic agent) operating rationally, each seeking to maximize their individual utility or profit by making choices based on available information. Mainstream economics is largely neoclassical in its assumptions. There have been many critiques of neoclassical economics, both from within orthodox economics, and from outside of it, and often these critiques have been incorporated into new versions of neoclassical theory.

Network Society: The term Network Society was coined by Manuel Castells as part of his extensive analysis of modern society. The network society goes further than the information society that is often proclaimed. Castells argues that it is not purely the technology that defines modern societies, but also cultural, economical and political factors that make the network society.

Paradigm Shift: A complete change in thinking or belief systems that allows the creation of a new condition previously thought impossible or unacceptable. It just does not happen but rather driven by changes. A paradigm shift is the term first used by Thomas Kuhn in his famous 1962 book *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* to describe the process and result of a change in basic assumptions within the ruling theory of science. It has since become widely applied to many other realms of human experience as well. Presently agents of change are driving a new paradigm shift. The signs are all around us. For example, the introduction of the personal computer and the Internet has impacted both personal and business environments, and is a catalyst for a Paradigm Shift. We are shifting from a mechanistic, manufacturing, industrial society to an organic, service based, information centered society, and increases in technology will continue to impact globally. Change is inevitable. It's the only true constant.

Patent: A patent is a set of exclusive rights granted by a government to a person the sole right to make, use and sell, for a fixed period of time in exchange for the regulated, public disclosure of certain details of an invention. The person applying for a patent does not need to be the inventor who created or authored the invention. Many audio and video technologies are covered by patents.

Privatisation: Privatisation is the process of transferring property, from public ownership to private ownership and/or transferring the management of a service or activity from the government to the private sector.

Radioactive Wastes: Radioactive by-products from the operation of a nuclear reactor or from the reprocessing of depleted nuclear waste.

Renewable Energy Resources: Resources that are continually being renewed and replenished and are unlikely to run out. They include solar energy, hydropower, wind, waves and tides. Renewable energy and energy efficiency technologies are key to creating a clean energy future. Most renewable energy comes either directly or indirectly from the sun. Sunlight, or solar energy, can be used directly for heating and lighting homes and other buildings, for generating electricity, and for hot water heating, solar cooling, and a variety of commercial and industrial uses.

Scientific Information: These are Factual inputs, data, models, analyses, technical information, or scientific assessments based on scientific data. This includes any communication or representation of knowledge such as facts or data, in any medium or form, including textual, numerical, graphic, cartographic, narrative, or audiovisual forms

Development, Displacement and Social Movements

Service Economy: The service economy consists of all those economic activities not involved in the production and processing of goods and energy. Service economy can refer to one or both of two recent economic developments. One is the increased importance of the service sector in industrialised economies. Services now account for a higher percentage of GDP than just 20 years ago.

Social Exclusion: This is a term to describe marginalisation from employment, income, social networks such as family, neighbourhood and community, decision making and from an adequate quality of life, the various ways in which people are excluded (economically, politically, socially, culturally) from the accepted norms within a society.

Social Sector: Social sector of an economy includes those areas where any investment may not gain financial returns. Social sector investments lead to the accumulation of human and social capital in a society. Social sector mainly includes poverty eradication, employment generation, education, health, water supply, sanitation, housing, slum development, social welfare and nutrition, rural employment and minimum basic services.

Staple Food: A staple food is a basic but nutritious food that forms the basis of a traditional diet, particularly that of the poor. Although nutritious, staple foods generally do not by themselves provide a full range of nutrients, so other foods need to be added to the diet to prevent malnutrition. Staple foods vary from place to place, but are usually of vegetable origin, from cereals, pulses, corn, rice, millets and plants growing starchy roots.

Symbolic Analysts: Symbolic analysts solve, identify, and broker problems by manipulating symbols. They simplify reality into abstract images that can be rearranged, juggled, experimented with, communicated to other specialists, and then, eventually, transformed back into reality. The manipulations are done with analytic tools, sharpened by experience. These tools may be mathematical algorithms, legal arguments, financial gimmicks, scientific principles, psychological insights about how to persuade or to amuse, systems of induction or deduction, or any other set of techniques for doing conceptual puzzles (Robert B. Reich 1991).

Trade Deficit: Trade deficit is an excess of imports over exports. Trade Surplus is an excess of exports over imports. Balance of trade means both surplus or deficit. The Balance of trade is made up of transactions in merchandise and other movable goods. Balance of trade figures are the sum of the money gained by a given economy by selling exports, minus the cost of buying imports.

Trade Secrets: A trade secret is a confidential practice, method, process, design, or other information used by a company to compete with other businesses. It is also referred to in some jurisdictions as confidential information.

Vicious Cycle: A Vicious cycle is a cycle in which one problem leads to another, which in turn aggravates the first problem. For example poverty. A poor person may not be able to invest in the education of their children or to provide enough economic support this may in turn lead to the poverty of the younger generation also.

Water Conservation: Water conservation means the care, preservation, protection, and wise use of water with methods ranging from more efficient practices in farm, home and industry to capturing water for use through water storage or conservation projects etc.

World Wide Web (WWW): A hypermedia-based system for browsing Internet sites. It is named the Web because it is made of many sites linked together; users can travel from one site to another by clicking on hyperlinks. The World Wide Web is a portion of the Internet comprised of a constellation of networked resources. Its Internet servers utilise HTTP to transfer documents and multimedia files formatted in hypertext markup language (HTML). Not all servers on the Internet are part of the World Wide Web.

References

- Abraham, Biju Paul 2000. "The Emerging Patents and Intellectual Property Rights Regime: Implications for Indian Economy". In Purushottam Battacharya and Ajitava Roy Chaudhuri (ed.) *Globalisation and India: A Multidimensional Perspective*. Lancers Books: New Delhi
- Acharya, S. 2001. *India's Macroeconomic Management In The Nineties*. Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations: New Delhi
- Anderson, Benedict 1983. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Verso: New York
- APEC Economic Committee 2000. *Towards Knowledge-based Economies in APEC*. APEC Secretariat: Singapore <http://www.apecsec.org>
- Australian Council of Trade Unions 1994. *Green Jobs Industry*. Australian Conservation Foundation: Australia
- Balakrishnan, N. 2001. "Information and Communication Technologies and the Digital Divide in the Third World Countries". In *Current Science*. 81(8): 966-972
- Balakrishnan, P. 1996. "The Current Macroeconomic Stabilisation Programme and the Indian Economy." In M. Chattopadhyay, P. Maiti and Rakshit (ed.) *Planning and Economic Policy in India*. Sage Publications: New Delhi
- Bandyopadhyay, D. 1997. "People's Participation in Planning: Kerala experiment" In *Economic and Political Weekly* 32(39): 2450-54
- Banerji, Arun Kumar 2000. "Adjusting to the process of Change: India and Globalisation". In Purushottam Battacharya and Ajitava Roy Chaudhuri (ed.) *Globalisation and India: A Multidimensional Perspective*. Lancers Books: New Delhi
- Bardhan, P. 2001. "Social Justice in Global Economy". *Economic and Political Weekly*. February 3-10
- Bardhan, P. 2003. *Poverty, Agrarian Structure, and Political Economy in India*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Barrett, M. 1998. *Women's Opression Today*. Verso: London
- Batliwala, S. 1993. *Empowerment of Women in South Asia: Concepts and Practices*. ASSBAF and FAO Freedom from hunger campaign, Action and Development: New Delhi
- Baxi, Upendra 1992. *Globalisation - A World Without Alternatives*. Sare Economists: New Delhi
- Bedi, Arjun. S. 1999. "The Role of Information and Communication Technologies in Economic Development: A Partial survey". Paper presented at the Global Development Network Meeting, Bonn
- Bell, Daniel 1976. *The Coming of Postindustrial Society: A Venture in Social Science Forecasting*. Basic Books: New York
- Beteille, Andre 2000. *Antinomies of Society: Essays on Ideologies and Institutions*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Beyer, Peter F. 2003. "Four Approaches to Globalisation". In Robertson R. and Kathleen E. White (ed.) *Globalization Critical Concepts in Sociology*. Routledge: London
- Blaney, D. L., and Pasha, M.K. 1993. "Civil Society and Democracy in the Third World: Ambiguities and Historical Possibilities". In *Studies in Comparative International Development*. Vol. 28, No. 1: 3-24
- Bloustein, S. et al 1992. *An Assessment of the Chemical Industry's Commitment to the Principles of Community Right to Know*. RMIT: Melbourne
- Blumer, H. 1951. "Social Movement". In A.N. Less (ed.) *New Outlines of Principles of Society*. Barnes and Noble: New York
- Bodmer, W. 1985. *The Public Understanding of Science*. Royal Society: London
- Boshier, R.W. et al. 1997. "Best and Worst-dressed Web Courses: Strutting into the Future in Comfort and Style". In *Distance Education*. 18, 1: 327-349
- Boyd Barrett, O. (1998). "Media Imperialism Reformulate". In D. K. Thussu, (ed.) *Electronic Empires: Global Media and Local Resistance*. Arnold: London
- Bresser, Pereira and Luiz, Carlos 1996. *Economic Crisis and State Reforms in Brazil. Towards a New Interpretation of Latin America*. Lynne Rienner: Boulder and London

- Brian, Pinto and Farah, Zahir 2004. *Why Fiscal Adjustment Now*. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3230 March
- Buggi, C., Reddy, S. and Gowda, G. 2001. "Impact of Globalisation on Agrarian Class Structure. Its implications for Indian villages". In *Third Concept*. January p 17-19
- Burns, E. Bradford 1993. *A History of Brazil*. Columbia University Press: Columbia
- Bush, Stephen 1993. "Indigenous Knowledge of Biological Resources: The Role of Anthropology". In *American Anthropology*. 95(3): 653-686
- Byres (ed.) 1998 *The Indian Economy: Major Debates Since Independence*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Cable, Vincent 1999. *Globalisation and Global Governance*. The Royal Institute of International Affairs: London
- Castells, M. 2001. *The Internet Galaxy: Reflections on the Internet, Business, and Society*. Oxford University Press: New York
- Castells, M. 1998. *The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture. Vol.1 The Rise of Network Society*. Blackwell Publishers: London
- Chadha, G.K. and P.P. Sahu 2002. "Setbacks in Rural Employment: Issues for Further Scrutiny". In *Economic and Political Weekly*. May 25
- Chand, Ramesh 1999. Emerging Crisis in Punjab Agriculture: Severity and Options for future. In *Economic and Political Weekly*. March 27
- Chanda, R. 2002. *GATS and Its Implications for Developing Countries: Key Issues and Concerns*. Department of Economic and Social affairs. United Nations: New York
- Chandhoke, Neera 1995 *State and Civil Society: Explorations in Political Theory*. Sage: New Delhi
- Cohen, Jean L. and Andrew Arato 1994. *Civil Society and Political Theory*. The MIT Press: Cambridge
- Coicaud, Jean Marc and Veijo, Heiskanen (ed.) 2001. *The Legitimacy of International Organisations*. University Press: Tokyo
- Correa, Carlos M. 2000. Intellectual Property Rights, the WTO and Developing Countries: The TRIPs Agreement and Policy Options. Third World Network: Penang
- Crede, Andrews and Robin Mansell 1998. *Knowledge Societies in a Nutshell: Information Technology for Sustainable Development*. IDRC: Canada
- Curran, J. and Gurevitch, M. (eds) 2001. *Mass media and Society*. Edward Arnold: London
- Deaton, A. 2003. "Is World Poverty Falling?" *Southern Economist*. January p. 21
- Deaton and Dreze 2002. *Poverty and Inequality in India: A Re-examination*. Centre for Development Economics Working Paper. Delhi School of Economics: New Delhi
- Desai, Meghnad and Yahia Said (eds.) 2004. *Global Governance and Financial Crises*. Routledge: London
- Desai, Mira K. 2005. "Intra and Inter-Cultural Diversities in the Era of Globalization: Transnational Television in India". In *Global Media Journal*. Volume 4, Issue 7 http://lass.calumet.purdue.edu/ccg/gmj/Fall2005/non_referreed/DesaiFa05.htm
- Deshingkar, J.P. and Anderson 2004. "Agriculture and Natural Resource based livelihoods in an era of Economic Reform and Globalisation". In J.P. Deshingkar and C. Johnson (ed.) *Policy Windows and Livelihood Futures: Trends and Prospects for Poverty Reduction in Rural India*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Dev and Mooij 2002. "Social Sector Expenditures in the 1990s. An analysis of Centre and State Budgets". *Economic and Political Weekly*. March 2-8
- Dev, S. Mahendra and Ajit Ranade 1999. "Persisting Poverty and Social Insecurity. A Selective Assessment". Kirit S. Parikh (ed.) *India Development Report*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Dierkes, M. and Von Grote, C. (eds) 2000. *Between Understanding and trust: The Public, Science, and Technology*. Harwood Academic Publishers: Amsterdam
- Drucker Peter, F. 1988. "The Coming of the New Organization". In *Harvard Business Review*. 88: 45-53
- Drucker, Peter 1994. *Post-Capitalist Society*. Harper Business: New York
- Edsalt, S. 2000. *GATS to Impact Public Education*. NSW Teachers Federation: Education on Live. Development Policy No. 7, August

- Edwards, Michael 2000. *NGO Rights and Responsibilities: A New Deal for Global Governance*. Central Books: UK
- Erickson, J. 1998. "Online - and in fashion. "The Internet comes into its own as a Catalyst for Political Change and Economic Activity". In *Asiaweek*. December 25
- Eyerman, R. and Jamison, A. 1991. *Social Movement: A Cognitive Approach*. Polity Press: Cambridge
- Feather, John 1998. *The Information Society: A Study of Continuity and Change*. Library Association Publishing: London
- Foray, D. and B.A. Lundvall, (1996), "The Knowledge-based Economy: from the Economics of Knowledge to the Learning Economy". In OECD *Employment and Growth in the Knowledge-Based Economy*. OECD: Paris
- Foucault, M. 1977. *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison* (Translated from French by Alan Sheridan), Allen Lane: London
- Frase, P and O'Sullivan, B. 2003 *The Future of Education Under the WTO*. www.campusdemocracy.org/wtoed.html.
- Freeman, L. 1999. *Gulliver in Southern Africa: South Africa and Zimbabwe in the Post-Apartheid Era*. Paper delivered at the University of Western Australia, Perth, 26-29 November-1999
- Freire, P. 1972. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Penguin Books: Middlesex
- Galligan, B., Roberts, W. and Trifiletti, G. 2001. *Australians and Globalisation: The Experience of Two Centuries*. Cambridge University Press: U.K.
- Galtung, J. 1979. *Development, Environment and Technology: Towards a Technology of Self Reliance*. United Nations: New York
- Georgios, I. et al 2004. *Social and Economic Transformation in Digital Era*. India Group: U.K.
- Ghosh, A. 1991. "The Budget and its Relevance for Restructuring the Economy". In *Economic and Political Weekly*. vol. XXVI:34, 2011-2019.
- Ghosh, J. 1998. "Liberalization Debates". In T.J Byres (ed.) *The Indian Economy: Major Debates Since Independence*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi.
- Giddens, A. 2000. *The Third Way and its Critics*. Mass Polity Press: Malden Jhabvala, Renana and Sinha, Shalini 2002. "Liberalisation and the Women Workers". *Economic and Political Weekly*. May
- Gill, S.S. 2003 "Globalization: Higher Education will suffer". In *The Tribune*. July 20
- Gladieux, L.E. and Swail, W.S. 1999. *The Virtual University and Educational Opportunity*. The College Board: Washington, DC
- Gordon, Sandy 1997. "Globalisation and the Economic Reforms in India". In *Australian Journal of International Affairs*. Volume 51, No. 1
- Government of India 1988. *India, 1988-89*. Publications Division, Government of India: New Delhi
- Government of India 2003. *India, 2003-04*. Publications Division, Government of India: New Delhi
- Gramsci, A. 1998 (rpt). *Selections From the Prison Notebooks*. Orient Longman: Chennai
- Gray, R. H., and C. D. Becker. 1993. "Environmental Cleanup: The Challenge at the Hanford Site, Washington, USA." *Environment Management*. 17:461-475
- Griffin, Keith 2004. "Globalisation and Culture". In Stephen Cullenberg and Prasanta K. Pattnaik (ed.) *Globalisation, Culture and Limits of the Market*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Griffin, Michael 2002. "From Cultural Imperialism to Transnational Commercialisation: Shifting Paradigms in International Media Studies". *Global Media Journal*. Vol.1, issue 1 (<http://www.lass.calumet.purdue.edu/From Cultural Imperialism.htm>)
- Guha, A and Ray, A.S. 2000. "Multinational versus Expatriate FDI, A Comparative Analysis of the Chinese and Indian Experience". Indian Council For Research on International Economic Relations
- Gusfield, J.R. (ed.) 1972. *Protests, Reforms and Revolt: A Reader in Social Movement*. New Wiley and Sons: New Delhi

- Haberle, R. 1972. "Types and Functions of Social Movement". In *International Encyclopedia of Social Sciences*. Macmillan and Company: New York
- Hardiman, D. 1998. "Well Irrigation in Gujarat. Systems of Use, Hierarchies of Control." In *Economic and Political Weekly*. 33:25, p. 1533-1544
- Hazel, Henderson 1999. *Beyond Globalisation: Shaping a Sustainable Global Economy*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian
- Helene, Moussa 1999. *Global Surge in Forced Migration Linked to Colonial Past*. Women's Press: Toronto
- Henderson, D. 1999. *The MAI Affair: A Story and its Lessons*. The Royal Institute of International Affairs: London
- Herbst, Jeffrey 1990. *State Politics in Zimbabwe*. University of Zimbabwe Press: Harare
- Higgot, Richard and Antony, Payne (ed.) 2001. *New Political Economy of Globalisation*. Cheltenham: U.K.
- Hillary, John 1999. *Globalisation and Employment: New Opportunities, Real Threats*. Panos Briefing No.33 <http://www.nswef.org.au/edu>
- Hoffman, D.L. and Novak, T.P. 1998. "Bridging the racial divide on the Internet". In *Science*. April 17, 390-391
- Hurrell, Andrew 1992 "The International Politics of Amazonian Deforestation". In Andrew Hurrell and Benedict Kingsbury (ed.) *The International Politics of the Environment. Actors, Interests and Institutions*. Clarendon Press: Oxford
- Ila Patnaik, 2003. *India's Policy Stance on Reserves and the Currency*. Working Papers 108, Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations, New Delhi
- James, H. Marsh (editor in chief) 1988. *The Canadian Encyclopedia*. Second Edition, Volume 1. Murtin Publihers: Edmonton
- Jessop, Bob 2003. "The State and the Contradictions of the Knowledge-Driven Economy". In Bryson, J.R. et.al. (eds) *Knowledge, Space, Economy*. Routledge: London
- Joshi, V. and Little, I.M.D. 1998. *India's Economic Reforms 1991-2000*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Kacowicz, Arie M. 1999. *Regionalisation, Globalisation and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent or Overlapping Alternatives?* University of Notre Dame: Indiana
- Kapila, Uma, (ed.) 2000. *Indian Economy Since Independence*. Academic Foundation: New Delhi
- Keniston, S. 2003. *CMTE - the Underground Potential*. CMTE Postgraduate Conference. Brisbane: Australia 19 May
- Khan, A.R. 2003. *Economic Survey 2003-04*. V.P.G. Books: Delhi
- Khor, Martin 2001. *Rethinking Globalisation: Critical Issues and Policy Choices*. Books for Change: Bangalore
- Konenburg, J. 1986. *Empowerment of the Poor: A Comparative Analysis of Two Development Endeavours in Kenya*. Kninlijk Institute Voor de Tropan
- Kundu, A. Bagchi and Kundu, D. 1999. "Regional Distribution of Infrastructure and Basic Amenities in Urban India: Issues Concerning Empowerment of Local Bodies". *Economic and Political Weekly*. 34(28), July
- Kundu, Amitabh 2001. "Urban Development, Infrastructure Financing and Emerging Systems of Governence in India: A Perspective". In *Social Sciences Selection*. Vol. 4, No.5, April
- Kurian, C.T. 1994. *Global Capitalism and the Indian Economy*. Orient Longmont: New Delhi
- Latchem, C and Hanna, D. 2002. "Leadership for Open and Flexible Learning". *Open Learning*. 17(3), 203-215
- Lee, C.C. 1980 *Media Imperialism Reconsidered: The Homogenizing of Television Culture*. SagePublications: London
- Leonard, A. 1998. "Soweto online". In *Salon Magazine*. 16 November
- Lewenstein, B. 1992. "The Meaning of `Public Understanding of Science". In *Public Understanding of Science*. 1, 45-68
- Lokayan Bulletin, (Editorial) 1991. "Dams on the River Narmada: A Call to Conscience". May-August Vol. 9, No.3 and 4, Pp 1-10

- Lundvall, B.A and B. Johnson 1994. "The Learning Economy". In *Journal of Industry Studies*. Vol. 1, No 2, December, pp. 23-42
- Lyon, D. 1988. *The Information Society: Issues and Illusions*. Polity Press: Cambridge
- Makambe, John. 1996. *Participatory Development: The Case of Zimbabwe*. University of Zimbabwe Press: Harare
- Malcolm, Waters 2001. *Globalization*. Routledge: Oxford, UK
- Mandal, R. 1994. *Privatisation in the Third World*. Vikas Publishing House: New Delhi
- Mander, J. 1996 "Corporate Capitalism". In *Resurgence*. November/December, No. 179:10-12
- Mander, Jerry and Edward Goldsmith 1996. *The Case Against the Global Economy and for a Turn Toward the Local*. Sierra Club Books: San Francisco
- Maria J.F. Willumsen and Eduardo Giannetti da Fonseca (ed.) 1997. *The Brazilian Economy: Structure and Performance in Recent Decades*. North-South Centre Press: University of Miami
- Martinussen, John Degnohl 2001. *Policies, Institutions and Industrial Development*. Sage Publications: New Delhi
- Mascarenhas, M. 2003. "Unpalatable Truth". *The Hindu*. June 22
- Mathur, Hari Mohan and David Marsden (ed.) 1998. *Development Projects and Impoverishment Risks*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- McAdam, D. 1982. *Political Process and the Development of Black Insurgency 1930-1970*. University of Chicago Press: Chicago
- McCully, Patrick 1998. *Silenced Rivers. The Ecology and Politics of Large Dams*. Orient Longman Ltd.: Delhi
- McDelland and Steward Inc. 2000. *The Canadian Encyclopedia, 1999*. The Canadian Publishes: Toronto, Canada
- McLennan, Gregor 2000. "The New Positivity". In Eldridge, John et.al. (eds.) *For Sociology: Legacy and Prospects*. The Sociology Press: Durham
- McLuhan, Marshall 1964. *Understanding Media*. McGraw-Hill: New York
- Melucci, A. 1996. "Symbolic Challenge of Contemporary Movements". In S.M. Buechler and J. Cylke (ed.) *Studying Collective Action*. Sage Publications: London
- Modelski, George and Kazimierz Poznanski. 1996. "Evolutionary paradigms in the social sciences". *International Studies Quarterly* 40 (3): 315-20
- Morris, Merrill and Ogan, Christine(1996). "The Internet as a Mass Medium". In *Journal of Communication*. 46(1).39-50.
- Moussa, Helene 1999. *Global Surge in Forced Migration Linked to Colonial Past*. Women's Press: Toronto
- Moyo, S. 1995. *The Land Question in Zimbabwe*. SAPES Publication: Harare
- Naisbitt, J. 1986. *Reinventing the Corporation: Transferring Your Job and Your Company for the New Information Society*. Nicholas: London
- Nayyar, D. 1996. *Economic Liberalisation in India: Analytics, Experience and Lessons*. Orient Longman: Hyderabad
- Nayyar, D. 1997. *Globalisation: The Past in Our Future*. Third World Network: Penang, Malaysia
- Nhema, A.G. 2002. *Democracy in Zimbabwe: From Liberation to Liberalisation*. University of Zimbabwe Publications: Harare
- Night, J. 2002. *Trade in Higher Education Services: The Implications of GATS*. The Observatory on Borderless Higher Education: London
- Noble, D. 1997. *Digital Diploma Mills: The Automation of Higher Education*.
- O'Brian, R. 1992. *Global Financial Interpretation: The end of Geography*. The Royal Institute of International Affairs: London
- Ohmae, K. 1990. *The Borderless World*. Collins: New York
- Osborne, Thomas 2003. "On Mediators: Intellectuals and the Ideas Trade in Knowledge Society". In *Economy and Society*. 33(4) 430-447
- Ott, C. 1998. "Computers in the Classroom Promote a Conservative Vision of Education but Liberals don't Seem to Have Noticed". In *Salon Magazine*. August 28

- Panikkar, K.N. 1995. "Globalisation and Culture". In *The Hindu*. 4th October
- Parikh, Kirit, S. (ed.) 1999. *India Development Report*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Parikh, Kirit, S. and Ajay Shah 1999. "Second Generation Reforms". In Kirit S. Parikh (ed.) *India Development Report*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- Patnaik, P. 1986. "Public Debt as a Mode of Financing Public Expenditure: Some Comments." In *Economic and Political Weekly*. Vol. XXI, No. 35, August, pp.1545-1552
- Patnaik, P. 2003. *On the Economics of 'Open Economy' De-Industrialization*. V.V.Giri Memorial Lecture delivered at the Annual Conference of the Indian Society of Labour Economics, Kolkata, available from <http://www.macrosan.com>
- Patnaik, P. 2004. "On Financing Infrastructure on the strength of Reserves." In *Economic and Political Weekly*. December 25
- Patnaik, U. 2004 *The Republic Of Hunger*. Lecture delivered on the occasion of the 50th Birthday of Safdar Hashmi, Organized By Sahmat (Safdar Hashmi Memorial Trust) April, New Delhi
- Pavlik, John V., and Everette E. Dennis 1998. *New Media Technology: Cultural and Commercial Perspectives*. 2nd ed. Allyn and Bacon: Boston
- Peter, Flynn 1996. "Brazil: The Politics of the "Plano Real". In *Third World Quarterly*
- Pierse, J.N. 2001. Globalization and Collective Action. In Pierre Hamel (ed.) *Globalisation and Social Movements*. Palgrave: Great Britain
- Pierre, Hamel et al 2001. "The Shifting Frames of Collective Action". In Pierre Hamel (ed.) *Globalisation and Social Movements*. Palgrave: Great Britain
- Pinto, B. and F. Zahir 2004. *India: Why Fiscal Adjustment Now*. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 3230, March
- Pitroda, S. 1993. "Development, Democracy, and the Village Telephone". In *Harvard Business Review*. November-December, 66-68
- Poux, C. 2001. *Cultural Imperialism*. In <http://iml.jou.ufl.edu/projects/Spring01/Poux/Cultural%20Imperialism.html>
- Putnam, R. D. 1993. *Making Democracy Work: Civil Traditions in Modern Italy*. Princeton University Press: Princeton NJ
- Pyle, Jean. L. 2002. "Globalisation, Universities and Sustainable Development: a Framework for Understanding the Issues". In Jean L. Pyle and Robert Forrent (ed.) *Globalisation, Universities and Issues of Sustainable Human Development*. MPG Books Ltd.: Cornwall
- Rakshit, M. 1991. "The Macroeconomic Adjustment Programme: A critique." In *Economic and Political Weekly*. vol. XXVI: 34, 1977-1988
- Rakshit, M. 2002. "Some Macroeconomics of India's Reforms Experience: An Outline." Paper presented at The Indian Economy Conference at Cornell University, April, downloadable at <http://www.arts.cornell.edu/econ/indiaconf/Rakshit%20outline.pdf>
- Rakshit, M. 2004 "Some Puzzles of India's Macro economy." Paper presented at the National Conference in Honour of Prof. K.N.Raj at St. Thomas' College, Thrissur, October.
- Rakshit, Mihir 1998. *Studies in the Macroeconomics of Developing Countries*. OUP: New Delhi
- Rene Morissette, Xuelin Zhand and Marie Drolet 2003. "Are families getting richer". In *Canadian Social Trends*. Autumn 202, No. 66.
- Romer, Paul M. 1990. "Endogenous Technological Change". In *Journal of Political Economy*. University of Chicago Press, vol. 98(5), pages 71-102
- Roy, Alok 1997. "Economic Liberalisation in India: Balance of Payments Implications". In *Economic and Political Weekly*. July 11
- Roy, Alok 2000. "Globalisation challenges in India". In Purushottam Battacharya and Ajitava Roy Chaudhuri (ed.) *Globalisation and India: A Multidimensional Perspective*. Lancers Books: New Delhi
- Schiller, H.I. 1976. *Communication and Cultural Domination*. International Arts and Sciences Press: White Plains, NY
- Scholte, J.A. 1999. "Globalisation: Prospects of Paradigm Shift" In M. Shaw (ed.) *Politics of Globalisation: Knowledge, Ethics and Agency*. Routledge: London
- Scott, M. 2001. "Danger Landmines: NGO-Government Collaboration in the Ottawa Process". In *Non-Profit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*.

- Selnow, G. W. 2000. "Internet Ethics". In R. E. Jr. Denton (ed.) *Political Communication Ethics: an Oxymoron?* Praeger Publishers: CT, Westport
- Sen, A. and Himanshu 2004. "Poverty And Inequality In India-II, Widening Disparities During The 1990s." *Economic and Political Weekly*. September 25, 4361-4375.
- Sen, G. and C. Crown 1988. *Development, Crisis and Alternative Visions*. Earthscan: London
- SEWA 2004. *Impact of Globalisation on Informal Sector. A Casestudy of SEWA Members*. <http://www.sewa.org>
- Sharma, K. 1992. "Grass-root Organisations and Women's Empowerment: Some Issues in Contemporary Debates". In *Samya Shakti*. 1(6): 28-43
- Shaw Annapurna 1999. "Emerging Pattern of Urban Growth in India". *Economic and Political Weekly*. April 17-24
- Singh, N. and T. N. Srinivasan 2004. "Fiscal Policy in India: Lessons and Priorities," Paper presented at the NIPFP-IMF conference in New Delhi, February
- Singh, Nirvikar and T. N. Srinivasan 2004. *Foreign Capital Inflows, Sterilization, Crowding-Out and Growth*. Princeton University Press: Princeton
- SinghRoy, D.K. 2003(rpt). *Social Development and the Empowerment of the Marginalised: Perspectives and Strategies*. Saga Publication: New Delhi.
- Siva, Vandana 2005. "India: Soft Drinks, Hard Cases". *Le Monde Diplomatique*. March (<http://www.mindfully.org>)
- Smith, Peter 2001. "The Impact of Globalization on Citizenship: Decline or Renaissance?" *Journal of Canadian Studies* 36(1): 116-140
- Smythe, E. and P.J. Smith 2003. NGOs, Technology and the Changing Face of Trade Politics" In K.L.Brock (ed.) *Delicate Dances: Public Policy and the Non Profit Sector*. McGill-Queen's University Press: London
- Spanish Report 1998. *Green Jobs Project*.
- Srinivasan, T.N. 2003. *Indian Economic Reforms: A Stock Taking*. Stanford Centre for India Programme. Working Paper no. 190
- Statistics Canada 2001. *National Income and Expenditure Accounts*. Catalogue no. 13-001-PPB, 4th Quarter
- Stehr, Nico (2001) *The Fragility of Modern Societies: Knowledge and Risk in the Information Age*. Sage Publications: London
- Stephen, Deery and Nicholas, Kinnie (ed.) 2003 *Call Centres and Human Resource Management: a Cross-national Perspective*. Basingstoke: Hampshire, New York
- Stevens et al 2004. *The Impact of Reform of international trade on Urban and Rural Change*. Report to the rural-urban change policy division. DFID: London
- Strange, S. 1996. *The Retreat of the State: The Diffusion of Power in the World Economy*. Cambridge University Press: New York
- Streten, P. 1998 "The Contribution of Non-Governmental Organisations to Development". *Political Economy Journal of India*. Vol-6 No.2: 111-21
- Sundaram, K and S. D. Tendulkar 2003. "Poverty Has Declined in the 1990s: A Resolution of Comparability Problems in NSS Consumer Expenditure Data." *Economic and Political Weekly*. January 25.
- Sundaram, K. 2001. "Employment-Unemployment situation in the nineties: Some Results from the NSS 55th Round Survey". *Economic and Political Weekly*. March 17
- Swasti Mitter 2001. "Globalisation and ICT: Employment Opportunities for Women". In *IT Information Technology*. Vol. 11, No. 2 December
- Tarrow, S. 1994. *Power in Movement: Social Movements, Collective Action and Mass Politics in the Modern State*. Cambridge University Press: New York
- Taylor, Charles 1990. *Invoking Civil Society*. Working Papers, No. 5, Centre for Transcultural Studies, Chicago
- Toch, H. 1965. *Social Psychology and Social Movements*. Bobbs-Merrile: Indianapolis
- Toffler, Alvin 1980. *The Third Wave*. Pan Books: London
- Tolly 1978. *From Mobilization to Revolution*. Addison-Wesley: Massachusetts
- Tomilson 1991. *Cultural Imperialism: A Critical Introduction*. Pinter Publisher: London

Development, Displacement
and Social Movements

- Tuchman, G. 1981(revised edition). "The Symbolic Annihilation of Women by the Mass Media". In S. Cohen and J.Young (eds) *The Manufacture of News*. Constable: London
- UNCTAD 1996. *The TRIPs Agreement and Developing Countries*. New York and Geneva
- UNDP 1999. *Human Development Report*. Oxford University Press: New York
- UNDP 2003. *Human Development Report*. Oxford University Press: New Delhi
- United Nations 1999. *World Survey on the Role of Women in Development: Globalisation, Gender and Work*. United Nations Publications: Geneva
- Virmani, A. 2001. *India's 1990-91 Crisis: Reforms, Myths and Paradoxes*. Planning Commission Working Paper no. 4, December
- Volkmer, Ingrid 2003. *Dialectical Spaces in the Global Public Sphere, Media Memories Across Generations*. Joan Shorenstein Center on the Press, Politics and Public Policy, Harvard University, Cambridge. Working Paper Series, 2003-5.
- Wang G, Jan Servaes and A. Goonasekera 2000. *The Communications Landscape, Demystifying Media Globalisation*. Routledge: London
- Webster, Frank 1995. *Theories of the Information Society*. Routledge: London
- Weisman, D.L. and Sibley, D.S. 1998. "Raising Rivals Costs: The Entry of an Upstream Monopolist into Downstream Markets". In *Information Economics and Policy*. 10, 451-470
- Wilson, J. 1973. *Introduction to Social Movements*. Basic Books: New York
- Woolgar, Steve (ed.) 2002. *Virtual Society? Technology, Cyber bole, reality*. Oxford University Press: Oxford
- World Bank 1997. *The World Development Report*. OUP: New Delhi

Website Addresses

- <http://cade.icaap.org>
- <http://news.bbc.co.uk>
- <http://oecd.org>
- <http://sewa.org/>
- <http://twm.co.nz>
- <http://www.dcita.gov.au>
- <http://www.dfait-maeci.gc.ca>
- <http://www.economics.adelaide.edu>
- http://www.firstmonday.dk/issues/issue3_1/noble/index.html
- <http://www.greenpeace.org>
- <http://www.idsnet.org>
- <http://www.ilo.org>
- <http://www.indiaonline.com>
- <http://www.med.gov.nz>
- <http://www.mssrf.org/>
- <http://www.nationmaster.com>
- <http://www.opt-init.org>
- <http://www.pathfinder.com/asiaweek/current/issue/cs6.html>
- <http://www.phmovement.org>
- <http://www.photius.com>
- http://www.salonmagazine.com/21st/feature/1998/11/cov_feature2.html
- <http://www.thecornerhouse.org.uk>
- <http://www.usaid.gov>
- <http://www.citizen.org>
- <http://www.wto.org>