
UNIT 8 VETTING AND EVALUATION

Structure

- 8.0 Objectives
- 8.1 Introduction
- 8.2 Vetting and Evaluation
 - 8.2.1 Vetting
 - 8.2.2 Evaluation
 - 8.2.3 Difference between Vetting and Evaluation
- 8.3 Process of Vetting
- 8.4 Process of Evaluation
- 8.5 Let Us Sum Up
- 8.6 Suggested Reading
- 8.7 Answers to Exercises

8.0 OBJECTIVES

In this Unit we shall define and explain what is vetting and evaluation, the difference between the two and why we need to vet and evaluate translations. We shall also discuss the basic guidelines and tests required for vetting and evaluation and explain the process and results achieved, by

- i) giving definitions,
- ii) giving examples: single translations/multiple translations,
- iii) underlining difficult words, phrases and idioms and explaining through examples their significance in understanding the SL text better,
- iv) giving exercises and asking you to retranslate, vet and evaluate on the basis of the guidelines and tests explained in this unit.

After completing the Unit, you will be able to:

- vet and evaluate translations, by applying the given tests and guidelines;
- follow the correct procedures and techniques of vetting and evaluation according to the nature of the SL text;
- produce if not a model translation, at least a faithful version in terms of minimum structural and factual variations, expressed in grammatically correct language.

8.1 INTRODUCTION

In the solar system, earth is said to be one of the smallest planets, yet it has several billion people who speak different languages and belong to different cultures. Therefore, translation plays a very important role in understanding world history and human cultures. In fact translation has more relevance today than ever before. Since literature and arts have no national boundaries, we as translators try to introduce the rich literary, cultural and scientific heritage treasured in other languages to our own language readers. Therefore in the interest of mutual understanding it is absolutely necessary to produce accurate and well-written translations. In order to reach this goal, it is important that before sending translations to the press we check and cross-check them carefully and judiciously. This unit will guide you to be alert to the mistakes that can remain in a translation due to (a) carelessness, (b) ignorance of the subject and (c) lack of knowledge of the SL and TL. We have given you some exercises in vetting and evaluation which we hope you will complete as directed.

8.2 VETTING AND EVALUATION

In this section, we shall define vetting and evaluation and explain what we mean with the help of several examples. We shall also discuss the differences between vetting and

8.2.1 Vetting

Vetting derives from the verb *to vet* meaning to check and screen. Therefore, when we vet a given translation, we are supposed to make sure that we check the text carefully against all possible mistakes, deletions/additions, variations and structural oddities, so that it is acceptable to people i.e. to our common readers, as well as critics and experts.

Here are a few examples:

Ex. 1 The Municipal Committee will supply eggs to the schools.

स्कूल में म्यूंसिपल कमेटी अंडे देगी।

Ex. 2 Free treatment for the eyes.

मुफ्त आंखों का इलाज

Ex. 3 Dange has gone again into a state of unconsciousness.

डांगे फिर बेहोशी की हालत में चले गये हैं।

From the first translation it appears as if the Municipal Committee is a hen and will lay eggs in the schools. From the second translation it seems as if the eyes are free and not the treatment. In the third, it sounds as if Dange has voluntarily become unconscious.

Correct translations should be:

- 1) नगरपालिका स्कूलों में अंडों की आपूर्ति करेगी।
- 2) आँखों का मुफ्त इलाज।
- 3) डांगे फिर बेहोश हो गए।

Ex. 4 It was good bye to Rajiv and hello to V.P. Singh.

यह राजीव को नमस्कार कहना और वी. पी. सिंह को हेलो कहना था।

In the above sentence **goodbye** and **hello** are the two keywords. Wishing someone 'goodbye' has the implication of telling the person to go and not return at least until the time both parties want to see each other again. Saying hello implies cordiality, welcome and invitation to come in. Thus, a better translation would be:

इसका अर्थ था राजीव को अलविदा कहना और वी. पी. सिंह को गले लगाना।

Ex. 5 The dacoit succeeded in escaping.

डाकू भागने में सफल हो गया।

Ex. 6 The work is in progress.

कार्य प्रगति पर है।

Ex. 7 Blue eyed boy

नीलांख लड़का

These are literal translations. The translation in Example 5 seems to eulogize the escaping of the dacoit. On the contrary the meaning is डाकू भाग गया या निकल भागा।

In Example 6 it is better to write यहां काम हो रहा है।

In Example 7 the meaning is चहेता Eyes have nothing to do here.

As we can see, such translations distort the meaning of the original and result from a lack of understanding of the SL sentence to be translated.

8.2.2 Evaluation

To evaluate a translation means to judge or assess a finished work. When we evaluate, we talk about the merits and demerits of a translation on the basis of its significance,

value and quality after carefully studying its positive and negative features as a whole.

Leonard Forster in *Aspects of Translation* (p-20) has said that a good translation is like a clear glass where you can easily see what the original on the other side is like. Keeping this definition in mind we can evaluate a translation in three stages:

- 1) After the translation is complete, the translator can assume the role of the evaluator and try to go through it with a critical eye in order to see where some weaknesses or problems remain so that it may be vetted accordingly.
- 2) After the vetting has been done, it can once again be evaluated by a subject and language expert who knows both the SL and TL. This is necessary to check the text for correct expression and a coherent flow. Apart from this expert evaluation, it is also necessary to let the text be evaluated by the common reader, i.e. one who is not an expert. After taking all these comments and suggestions into consideration, we may send the copy to the press.
- 3) After the translation appears in print, it is again open to evaluation by the common reader as well as by the expert who may review it. These evaluative comments can only be incorporated at the reprint stage, not before.

Let us look at the following example that will illustrate our point.

A couple of years ago a very dear friend was operated upon for a slipped disc and had to spend several weeks at the All India Institute of Medical Sciences. I went to see her every afternoon for the five or six weeks that she was in the hospital. For the first few days she was alone in a private room which overlooked other wards. The atmosphere was most gloomy. Then she was shifted to the general ward and shared a room with six other ladies. It did not take them long to become friends and share fruits and other delicacies, their relatives and friends brought them. (Khushwant Singh: *Hindustan Times*, 25th August, 1984).

हिन्दी अनुवाद:

कुछ वर्ष पूर्व एक बहुत प्रिय मित्र का आल इण्डिया इन्स्टीट्यूट ऑफ मैडिकल साइन्सेस में कूल्हा उतर जाने के लिये आपरेशन हुआ था। वह पांच छः सप्ताह जब तक अस्पताल में रही, प्रत्येक दोपहर मैं उसे देखने जाता था। पहले कुछ दिनों तक वह एक प्राईवेट कमरे में अकेली थी, जहां से दूसरे वार्ड नहीं देखते थे। वातावरण बहुत अधिक अवसादपूर्ण था। फिर उसे जनरल वार्ड में भेज दिया गया जहां कमरे में छः महिलाएं भी थीं। उन्हें आपस में मित्र बनने में देर नहीं लगी और अपने सम्बन्धियों तथा मित्रों द्वारा लाये गये फल और खाने-पीने की चीजें आपस में बांटने लगीं। (खुशवंत सिंह; हिन्दुस्तान टाइम्स, 25 अगस्त, 1984)

What do we do first? After reading the passage in English and its Hindi translation carefully as many times as necessary, we try to form an impression about both passages. The passage in English is written in clear and simple prose marked by informality and spontaneity. The passage is autobiographical and apart from describing his observations, Khushwant Singh also narrates a personal experience. The spontaneity appears to be missing in the Hindi version. This assessment, which gives us an idea about the merit/demerit of a translation is evaluation.

In short, we can say that the translation is not too good because:

- 1) There are inaccurate translations of several words and phrases.
- 2) It does not read like a smooth narrative as in the original.
- 3) Difficult words are used which impede the flow of the language.

Once we have come to this conclusion, we will proceed to the next stage, that is, vetting. We will correct,

- i) the factual errors, (ii) substitute easier words where difficult ones have been used and iii) make the style more flexible.

In the above translation the word मित्र is used for female friend. In English the word friend is suitable but for the reader of a Hindi daily we have to specify it either as a

Similarly 'slipped disc' is not कूल्हे की हड्डी उतर जाना but रीढ़ की हड्डी के जोड़ों के बीच की चक्रिका का सरक जाना। Overlooking is not नहीं देखते थे but दीखते थे।

These are some of the factual mistakes. Let us now look at the language वातावरण बहुत अवसादपूर्ण था।

Considering that this is an informal kind of narration, the language is rather difficult. The use of the letter ण (twice) obstructs the smooth reading. We can easily write कमरे का माहौल बहुत उदास वा उबाऊ था or कमरे में गहरी उदासी छाई रहती थी।

Then the sentence मित्र बनने में देर नहीं लगी।

It obstructs the flow because, in Indian culture women are not मित्र but सहेली and a more idiomatic expression would be बहनाया जोड़ने में देर नहीं लगी।

Delicacies is not just खाने पीने की चीजें (eatables), but some delicious festive dishes. In Hindi this would be स्वादिष्ट पकवान or खाने की बढ़िया-बढ़िया चीजें।

The vetted passage has been re-phrased as:

कुछ साल पहले मेरी एक महिला मित्र की रीढ़ की हड्डी की एक चक्रिका सरक जाने के कारण, आपरेशन हुआ था। इसलिये उसे कई हफ्ते तक अखिल भारतीय आयुर्वेद संस्थान में रहना पड़ा। कोई पाँच या छह हफ्ते जब तक वह अस्पताल में रही मैं उसे रोज शाम को देखने जाया करता था। पहले कुछ दिन वह एक प्राइवेट कमरे में अकेली थी, जहां से दूसरे वार्ड दिखाई पड़ते थे। उस कमरे के माहौल में हर वक्त एक उदासी-सी छाई रहती थी लेकिन बाद में उसे जनरल वार्ड में भेज दिया गया जहाँ छह और मरीज भर्ती थीं। जल्दी ही वे आपस में सहेलियां बन गईं और रिश्तेदारों तथा मित्रों द्वारा लाये हुये फलों और स्वादिष्ट व्यंजनों को मिल बांट कर खाने लगीं।

In the suggested translation the vetter has tried to:

- i) Correct the inaccurate or obscure words/expressions.
- ii) Use an easy language spoken daily and used in daily newspapers. For example, for slipped disc, instead of using the difficult medical term we have explained it. We have also accepted English words like private, general ward, operation, because they are now a part of our vocabulary and easily understood by everybody. If the text was meant for medical students, then we would certainly use the technical terms. But for the ordinary newspaper reader, a jargon-free vocabulary had to be used in the interests of quick comprehension.

The original is an enjoyable piece and the same enjoyment must be conveyed to the reader in the translated version.

Let us now look at the vetted passage and evaluate it. The vetter has used अखिल भारतीय आयुर्वेद संस्थान instead of All India Institute of Medical Sciences. We know that most people know the hospital by its latter name and it may have been preferable to leave it as such. In this version 'afternoon' has been translated as "शाम". We will notice that such problems will remain even in vetted texts. However, this passage is easier to read than the earlier one and most factual errors of the previous passage have been corrected. By making minor changes, wherever we find necessary, we can send this passage for printing.

We have seen from the above example that evaluation and vetting go hand in hand. Let us now see the difference between the two.

8.2.3 Difference between Vetting and Evaluation

As we have seen, we evaluate a text before and after vetting in order to access its merits and demerits. But when we get down to making changes in the interests of factual and linguistic accuracy, what we are doing is vetting. In vetting, we revise and correct whereas in evaluation we simply assess.

After translation, evaluating the passage briefly is the first stage. Then we may vet the passage and evaluate and edit it before finalization.

Who does the vetting?

- a) Generally, it would be someone other than the translator him/herself so that s/he may be more objective.
- (b) However, sometimes it is done in collaboration with the translator who may have specific reasons for choosing a particular word or expression. In any case, if the vetter feels that the grammatical structure of a sentence is incorrect or a wrong synonym is used s/he has the full freedom to make the necessary changes.
- (c) Sometimes a translator, after a sufficient lapse of time can vet his/her own translation.
- (d) Or the vetting may first be done by a subject expert and finally by a language expert.

What about Evaluation?

The evaluator and vetter may be the same person or they may be different. For example, a translation may be evaluated by one person and passed on to another for vetting.

Why do we need to vet and evaluate?

It is not possible for one single person to learn all the languages, sciences and arts. However capable, human capacities are always limited. Then translation is not easy. In fact a good translator must know the subject and the TL well enough so that not only the words and phrases are re-created but also the spirit of the original. Because of the many complexities in translation, errors remain and need to be vetted so that the vetter can plug the holes left by the translator. It is said that the translator of literary texts serves two muses and two cultures. So also the vetter who in addition, safeguards the reputation of both the writer as well as the translator.

A good evaluator reads the SL text carefully and sympathetically. Then s/he compares it with the original because s/he is supposed to be a master of both the SL and the TL. Since faultless translations do not exist, an evaluator need not worry about small faults but first look for the good points and then indicate the discrepancies not as a condemnation but to guide and inspire the translator so that the same mistakes are not repeated in other translations. In addition to this, necessary corrections in the text under consideration have to be made in the light of the changes suggested by the evaluator. A writer cannot sleep once s/he starts writing but a translator cannot sleep even when the work is done. Therefore s/he is to be encouraged, not slighted.

And if the translation is completely faulty and unreadable, it is not worth either vetting or evaluating. It can be discarded and a fresh translation made to replace it by some more competent translator.

Exercise I

We have given you the first paragraph of a short story in English as well as its 3 translated versions. Evaluate the translated passages and vet them. Finally prepare your own version. After you have done that, turn to the discussion in Answers to Exercises.

English Text

One evening in May a man who had lost his job and whose wife had left him, came to a bridge beneath which a shallow river flowed. The sun was setting and the man thought with fine irony that it was a peculiarly appropriate time for suicide. So he swung his feet over the bridge and dropped into the water that moved lazily underneath, and found that he could not bring himself to sink like a stone, but instead, moved by some compulsion had to swim to the bank. A spectator grinningly queried whether he had been trying to kill himself and having asked the question facetiously did not expect a serious answer. He paid no attention therefore when the man dripping wet, in a ruined business suit, replied in the affirmative before shuffling away.

मई की एक संध्या। एक मनुष्य जिसकी नौकरी चली गई और जिसकी पत्नी उसे परित्याग कर गई थी एक पुल पर पहुंचा जिसके नीचे एक उथली नदी बहती थी। सूर्य का अवसान हो रहा था और उसने सोचा, कितनी सुन्दर विडम्बना है कि आत्महत्या के लिये वही अनपेक्षित रूप से उपमुक्त क्षण है। उसने दोनों पैरों को पुल पर झुला दिया तथा उस अकिराम गति से प्रवाहित नदी में वह कूद पड़ा, किन्तु शिला के सदृश वह अपने को डुबा नहीं सका। वरन किसी आग्रह से, उसे किनारे की ओर तैरना पड़ा। वहां किसी दर्शक ने मुस्कराते हुये उससे प्रश्न किया कि आत्महत्या के लिये क्या वह तुला था और चूंकि उसने सीधे मुख पर प्रश्न किया था, उससे प्रत्युत्तर की अपेक्षा नहीं की। किन्तु अपने भीगे हुये सूट से जल टपकाते हुये जब उसने हामी भरी और पलायन किया, दर्शक ने उसकी ओर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया।

Translated Version - 2

मई की एक शाम। एक आदमी जिसकी नौकरी छूट गई थी और जिसकी पत्नी ने उसे छोड़ दिया था, एक पुल पर आया जिसके नीचे एक छिछली नदी बह रही थी। सूर्य अस्त हो रहा और उसका सोचना कैसा विडम्बनापूर्ण था, कि आत्महत्या के लिये वह विचित्र रूप से उपयुक्त समय है। इसलिये उसने पुल पर से छलांग लगाकर नीचे मंथर गति से बहते हुये जल में अपने को गिरा दिया और उसने पाया कि अपने को एक पत्थर की तरह डूब जाने देना, उसके वश के बाहर है, बल्कि उसे किसी विवशता के वशीभूत होकर तैर कर किनारे तक जाना पड़ रहा है। एक दर्शक ने मुस्कराते हुये उससे पूछा कि कहीं वह अपने को मार डालने की कोशिश तो नहीं कर रहा था और परिहासपूर्ण ढंग से प्रश्न पूछने के बाद उसने किसी गंभीर उत्तर की अपेक्षा नहीं की। इसीलिये नष्ट हो गये व्यापारी सूट में और पानी से लथपथ उस आदमी ने खिसकने के पहले जब स्वीकारात्मक उत्तर दिया तो उस दर्शक ने कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया।

Translated Version - 3

मई मास की एक सन्ध्या को एक व्यक्ति एक पुल पर पहुंचा। नीचे एक उथली नदी बह रही थी। उस व्यक्ति की नौकरी छूट चुकी थी और उसकी पत्नी उसे छोड़ कर कहीं चली गई थी। प्रकृति की भी अजीब विडम्बना थी। उधर सूर्य अस्त हो रहा था और इधर वह व्यक्ति अपने प्राणान्त करने की सोच रहा था। उसने अपने पांव नीचे की ओर लटका दिये और मंद बहते हुये जल में छलांग लगा दी। उसने अनुभव किया कि पत्थर की तरह वह नीचे नहीं डूब पा रहा था किन्तु कोई अदृश्य शक्ति उसे किनारे की ओर तैरने को बाध्य कर रही थी जब वह किनारे पर पहुंचा तो उसके शरीर से पानी बुरी तरह चू रहा था और उसकी पोशाक बिल्कुल खराब हो चुकी थी। वहां खड़े एक दूसरे व्यक्ति ने जो यह सब देख रहा था, मुस्कराते हुये उससे पूछा कि क्या उसका इरादा अपनी जीवन लीला समाप्त करने का था। अपने इस उपहासपूर्ण उत्तर की उसे कोई आशा नहीं थी इसलिये जब पहले व्यक्ति ने गंभीरता से इसे स्वीकार किया और चुपचाप वहां से खिसक गया तो भी किनारे पर खड़े दर्शक ने कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया।

8.3 PROCESS OF VETTING

Vetting and evaluating translations is a rather important aspect of the translation process. We have valuable literary treasures in different languages and quite a few of them have been translated but there are no clear-cut rules and guidelines to lead the kindly light for vetters and evaluators. Established writers translated whenever they wished to do so or were asked to translate for the enrichment of their languages and literature. There was hardly any standard system of vetting and almost no evaluations were done. Let us, therefore, attempt to formulate some rules although they can only be very general at this stage.

General Rules and Tests

- Before you begin to vet a translation, it is advisable to read the original as well as the translated text and try to first grasp the general purport and basic thought. At this stage the language aspect can wait.
- ● The translator has done his/her job as best as s/he could, now you as a vetter have to oversee that the text conveys the correct overall meaning and not just the external and individual meaning of words and phrases.
- ● ● The translation is supposed to be read by those who do not know the SL and so are not able to read and enjoy the original. After checking the content it is the style and language which has to be supervised. The vetter is at a disadvantage because s/he cannot change the style of the translator, otherwise s/he may as well do the whole translation over again. The content and style of the original, the translator's recording of these into the TL and the smooth readability of the text have, to be borne in mind at all times.
- ● ● ● If the translator has omitted a footnote to explain some alien idea or personage, because s/he did not want to take the pains of going to the original reference material, you as a vetter cannot escape this responsibility and are supposed to fill the gaps after due checking. There are no short cuts to this arduous road. Take for example:
 - 1) Mani Shankar Aiyar still calls Rajiv Sir and has never been invited in for a glass of frascati or a plate of fettuccine.

In this sentence frascati means Italian wine from Frascati (a town in Italy famous for its wine) and fettuccine is a kind of Italian pasta. This has to be explained in the footnotes.

- 2) बनारस के शाइलाकों ने एक-एक देकर तीन-तीन की हंडियाँ लिखवानी आरम्भ की।

Here the character of Shylock as a moneyed Jew in Shakespeare's play *The Merchant of Venice* must be explained.

Polysemy or Multi-meaning of Words

Sometimes the same word may mean three or more different things and if the translator has made a blunder by choosing the wrong synonym, the vetter must check and correct it. For example the word सैधव means salt, horse or a domicile of Sindh. Now as a vetter you cannot allow 'salt' to go for a horse or a Sindhi. Dressing means to put on clothes and it also means the decoration over salad or cake. We cannot mix up the two. The correct use of the meaning can only be gauged from the context in which it occurs.

Shadow of English Syntax

Generally when one translates from English into Hindi, the translator carries over the English syntax to Hindi sentences or vice versa. The result is long and involved sentences which may be unintelligible and at times even funny. Such translations may be called shadow translations. As vetters we must be alert to such problems. Let us look at some sentences in order to see the grammatical and linguistic peculiarities and oddities in the translated text:

Compound Sentences Translated into a Compound Sentence

I am reopening the account as guardian of the minor as it is desired to utilize the money for the benefit of the minor and to eventually make the money lying in the credit of the account available to the minor on his attaining majority.

Hindi Translation

में नाबालिग के संरक्षक की हैसियत से एक नया खाता खोल रहा हूँ ताकि नाबालिग की भलाई के लिये यह रकम काम में आये और अन्त में नाबालिग के व्यस्कता प्राप्त कर लेने पर खाते में जमा की हुई रकम का वह उपयोग कर सके।

In English it is a long compound sentence but in Hindi instead of following the same pattern it can easily be broken into the following two sentences:

में नाबालिग के संरक्षक की हैसियत से एक नया खाता खोल रहा हूँ। इससे इस खाते में जमा की हुई रकम नाबालिग की भलाई के काम आ सकेगी और व्यस्कता प्राप्त कर लेने पर वह इसका उपयोग कर सकेगा।

Literal and Odd translations

- 1) It is at its lowest point.
यह अपने निम्नतम बिन्दु पर है।
- 2) If the printing presses lie.
यदि छापेखाने आराम करते हैं।
- 3) Print order
छपाई संख्या
- 4) Drop letter
अक्षर को गिरा दो
- 5) The teenager girls who immolated themselves.
अग्निदग्धा किशोरियाँ

Closer translations would be:

- 1) इसकी स्थिति अत्यंत शोचनीय है
- 2) यदि समाचार पत्रों में कोई बात गलत छपती है
- 3) छापने का आदेश
- 4) बड़ा अक्षर लगाओ
- 5) आग में जलकर मरने वाली लड़कियाँ

Conclusion

In vetting you:

- 1) Correct a synonym if used incorrectly;
- 2) Add footnotes wherever the translator has omitted them;
- 3) Break the English sentence in two or three Hindi sentences instead of following a long and complicated English sentence structure.
- 4) Translate into proper Hindi and not into a shadow of English. It should read as if it was originally written in Hindi.
- 5) Correct literal translations and making them idiomatic wherever possible.
- 6) If a word, sentence or idea has been misinterpreted, it should be corrected.

8.4 PROCESS OF EVALUATION

We can now start evolving a suitable test and procedure for assessing and evaluating translations. There is a general view that the best translation is that, from which if we re-translate, we get back the original. This may be true either in the case of very closely-related languages or in factual informative texts. Since English and Hindi are distantly related languages, this test cannot be applicable. It is mainly the European theorists who support this idea because all their languages originate from the same classical languages, Greek and Latin. To get back to the original by re-translating the translation, the vocabulary, idiom, and grammatical structure should either be identical or very similar. Since this is not true in case of English and Hindi, we cannot apply this rule unless the text is factual or informative. Take, for example, the following sentences.

Factual and Informative Texts

- 1) He is going to Kanpur.
वह कानपुर जा रहा है।

Re-translation

He is going to Kanpur.

- 2) Today he deposited Rs. 2000/- in my name.
आज उसने मेरे नाम में 2000/- रुपये जमा किये।

Re-translation

Today he deposited two thousand rupees in my name.

In these sentences since there is simple information, it is possible to re-translate and get back the original text.

Translating in Non-Related Languages

- 1) A poor man's wife is everyone's sister-in-law.
गरीब की जोरू सबकी भाभी ।
- 2) It is a million dollar question.
यह बड़ा अहम सवाल है।
- 3) That girl is extremely nice..
लड़की क्या है एक दम गऊ है।

Bhabhi is a very close and informal relationship in India. Younger brothers, cousins, and friends liberties and cut jokes with a bhabhi but a sister-in-law is a very general term in English and all sister-in-laws cannot be bhabhis.

In the second example, dollar is neither our currency nor do we have the dollar culture. We cannot translate it as

यह दस लाख डालर वाला सवाल है।

In the third example, when we say that a girl is like a गऊ, it means that she is very simple and innocent. If in English we say that girl is a cow, we are criticising her rather than paying a compliment.

English and Hindi differ a lot in their grammar and idiom and this makes translation a difficult art. Let us now read the following passage and examine some of the problems that come up in its translation. This will help us in the task of assessment and evaluation.

Example

What we should aim at is not to admire the speaker but to follow him. The ancient historian tells that constituted the difference between Cicero, the polished speaker and Demosthenes, the burning orator. After a great speech in Rome, every tongue was loud in the praise of Cicero. But the people who listened to Demosthenes forgot the Orator. They went home with hurried stride, lowering brow, clenched fist, muttering in a voice like distant thunder – let us go and fight Philip.

The important ideas here are locked up in : to admire the speaker, to follow him, the polished speaker, the burning orator, clenched fist, a voice like thunder. If we stick to the words and phrases the effect is lost and the main object frustrated. Let us take up **polished speaker and burning orator**.

In the above passage we cannot literally translate 'polished speaker' as पालिश किया हुआ or चमकदार वक्ता । To polish the utensils etc. we use the word मॉजना ; so, the nearest expression would be मंजा हुआ वक्ता । Burning orator is not जलता हुआ भाषण कर्ता but ओजस्वी or उग्र वक्ता or भाषण देने वाला ।

If the full force and impact of the passage has to be brought out, the translator has to follow not the word, but the style of the original writer. Along with the style, s/he must also try to reproduce the effect on the mind of the reader. If the reader is not inspired to the same extent as the reader of the original, the purpose of the translation is defeated altogether.

Comments and translation

What do the expression polished speaker and burning orator mean? Polished here means that the language was polished and burning means that the speaker used fiery words which inspired the spectators to go to the battlefield immediately.

A more precise translation would be as follows:

हमें जिस बात का प्रयत्न करना चाहिये वह वक्ता की सराहना करना नहीं, बल्कि उसका अनुगमन करना है। एक प्राचीन इतिहासकार का कहना है कि सिसरो जैसे मंजे हुये वक्ता और ओजस्वी भाषण देने वाले डिमास्थनीज में यही अन्तर था। रोम में दिये सुप्रसिद्ध भाषण के बाद हर व्यक्ति सिसरो की प्रशंसा करते नहीं थकता था परन्तु जिन लोगों ने भी डिमास्थनीज का भाषण सुना वे वक्ता को तो भूल गये और पलकें झुकाए, मुट्ठियां कसे, दूर उठते तूफान के से स्वर में—चलो, हम फिलिप से युद्ध करेंगे—बड़बड़ाते हुये तेज कदमों से अपने-अपने घरों की ओर चल दिये।

Tests for evaluation

Shri Raghunath Rao in his monograph, *The Art of Translation*, has outlined certain tests of evaluating a translation:

- What is to be translated are the ideas of the author, not the bare words.
- The style of the translation should be like that of the original.
- The effect of the translation on the mind of the reader should be closely similar to if not identical with that of the original.

In other words we can say

- The matter of the translation means the matter of the original. Matter stands for ideas.
- The manner of the translation means the style of the original.
- The effect of the translation should be effect of the original. Effect means the effect on the mind of the reader.

The quality of the translation would depend on how best and how closely the matter, the manner and the effect have been transferred.

While talking about the possibilities of re-translation, we talked about closely related languages and the significance of words and their order in the SL text. In the above tests we have deliberately omitted it because in this unit we are dealing with English and Hindi which are non-related languages. In these two languages if we re-translate, we cannot get the exact text of the original unless the information sought is routine information.

We have already set some guidelines and tests for evaluating a translation. Now we will take an example where several translations of the same text are given and try to analyse the different shades of meaning and their effect. Shakespeare has said 'Our doubts are traitors'. In most cases, we will find that either the comprehension of the matter is faulty or the expressing capacity of the translator is limited. Consequently the effect is lost. One of the most important reasons for that is that although translation is a difficult art.

It has also become an art which is admitting more and more mediocre talent. After Hindi is made the official language of the country, translation has become more money-oriented rather than quality-oriented.

Exercise II

We have already set some guidelines and tests for evaluating a translation. Now we will give you an exercise where two translations of the same text are given. You try to underline and analyse the different shades of meaning and their effect on the readers. Let us now read the following passage carefully. But before we do that let us consider the following guidelines:

- Underline the difficult/idiomatic words/phrases in the English text.
- Compare their translation in the two given Hindi Translations.

- both the dictionary meaning and the implied meaning of a word/phrase;
- the grammatical structures of both the SL and TL;
- sentence meaning as a whole and not just of individual words;
- references – mythological, historical and cultural;
- the style of the writer.

Once we get to the *what* and *how* and for whom of the original distinctly, we can proceed to transfer them into the TL text as best and as satisfactorily as we can.

In this Unit, we have seen how

- vetting a translated text involves checking it against all possible mistakes, deletions/additions, variations and structural oddities with a view to making it acceptable;
- evaluation means judging or assessing a translated text;
- evaluation assesses a translated text for its merits or demerits, vetting involves making changes in the interest of factual and linguistic accuracy;
- vetting and evaluation go hand in hand and are required for checking the quality of a translated text.

8.6 SUGGESTED READING

You may like to consult any of the following:

Raghunath Rao, 1990, *The Art of Translation*, Bhartiya Anuvad Parishad, New Delhi.

G.S. Pande, *Problems of Translation*. Dissertation for Post Graduate Research Diploma of C.I.E.F.L. Hyderabad.

Anuvad Quarterly 43 1988. Bhartiya Anuvad Parishad.

डॉ. मंजुला दास, *अनुवाद सिद्धान्त और व्यवहार*—पराग प्रकाशन दिल्ली - 32।

8.7 ANSWERS TO EXERCISES

Exercise I

As we have seen in general, the translations differ because some translators are more concerned about the structural and semantic correspondence while other sacrifice the correspondence and try to stick to the words of the original and produce literal translations.

Structural and Lexical Differences

We take a few words and phrases to illustrate the point from the given text.

i) One evening in May

In translations 1 and 2 the translators have separated the adjective clause and have made it an independent sentence. They have also used two different words शाम and संध्या for evening.

ii) The sun was setting

The three different translations are

- सूर्य का अवसान हो रहा था।
- सूर्य अस्त हो रहा था।
- उधर सूर्य अस्त हो रहा था।

सूर्य, अवसान and अस्त all the three words block the flow in a descriptive text. A more simple and easy translation could have been सूरज डूब रहा था or डूबने वाला था।

iii) Shallow – Three variants उथली, छिछली और गहरी नहीं are used. Here the third is a negative translation, which is not necessary.

iv) grinning:

- a) मुस्कराते हुए
- b) मुस्कराते हुए
- c) मुस्कराते हुए।

All three translators have used the same word मुस्कराते हुए but grinning is a wide smile when you show the teeth and seem to be almost laughing. मुस्कराते हुए is a very soft and pleasant word which does not indicate the sense of 'grin'. Therefore दाँत निपोड़ते हुए would be a closer translation.

- v) **business suit:** 1. सूट 2. भीगे हुए सूट 3. पोशाक All the three variants don't give the exact intention of the writer. The man was working in an office and has lost his job as well as his wife. He cannot afford to spoil his suit. Since the man is alive the unknown spectator is laughing unconcernedly.

All three translators have used the same word विडम्बना but the connotation is different each time and not quite like the original. The scene is like a picture where the nature-painter has set everything in order and ready for the man to act. He is depressed, without a job and wife and wants to die. He has come to bridge, where a river is flowing, over there in the sky the sun is setting. It is going to be dark soon and a similar darkness is encircling his own body and soul. Isn't this an ironic situation that the Nature God has set a stage ready for him — he just has to jump down and then every thing will be over.

None of these translations present this kind of mental picture before the readers.

The writer is in sympathy with his hero and is in full command of his language.

These divergences are mainly for 4 reasons.

- 1) Conceptual interpretation of the same text, changes with different translators.
- 2) The same word is interpreted and substituted differently by different translators.
- 3) Dimensions of the same meaning depending on their sensibilities change with translators.
- 4) Manner of expression of the same meaning changes according to the linguistic background of different translators.

A more accurate translation could be as follows. Is this close to what you have done?

मई की एक शाम। एक आदमी जिसकी नौकरी छूट गई थी और पत्नी छोड़ गई थी, एक पुल पर पहुंचा। उसके नीचे एक उथली नदी बह रही थी। सूरज डूबने वाला था और उस आदमी ने सोचा "वाह, कैसी सुन्दर विडम्बना है, आत्महत्या करने के लिये योगायोग (मौका) है।" उसने पुल पर से छलांग लगाई और नीचे पानी में कूद पड़ा। पानी धीमी गति से बह रहा था और उसे ऐसा लगा कि वह पत्थर की तरह पानी में डूब नहीं पा रहा है, बल्कि किसी विवशता से प्रेरित होकर किनारे की तरफ लौट रहा है। एक प्रत्यक्षदर्शी ने उससे खिलखिलाते हुये पूछा—मरने की कोशिश कर रहे थे? यह सवाल उसने बस मजाक में यों ही पूछ लिया था इसलिये उसे उससे किसी गंभीर उत्तर की आशा नहीं थी। उस आदमी का कारोबारी सूट बुरी तरह भीग गया था और उससे पानी टपक रहा था। इसीलिये वहां से खिसकने के पहले जब उसने 'हां' कहा तो प्रश्नकर्ता ने उसकी बात पर कोई ध्यान तक नहीं दिया।

Exercise II

Compare your version with the following:

हमने यह सिद्धान्त प्रतिपादित किया कि साहित्य का अध्ययन करने के लिये हमारा सर्वप्रथम दायित्व है—लेखक की आत्मा में प्रवेश करना और गहरे पैठ कर उसके व्यक्तित्व के महत्वपूर्ण तत्वों को आत्मसात करना। इस कार्य में तुलनात्मक अध्ययन किस प्रकार हमारी सहायता कर सकता है, यह बताने के लिये और अधिक स्पष्टीकरण की आवश्यकता नहीं। यह मान्यता कि सभी प्रकार का उच्च अध्ययन तुलना द्वारा ही संभव है और उसी पर आधृत है जितनी साहित्य के अध्ययन के सम्बन्ध में सत्य तथा महत्वपूर्ण है उतनी ही विज्ञान के क्षेत्र में भी।